
Enhancing Training Effectiveness: Exploring the Impact of Participant Motivation at a Workforce Training Center in Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Desvi Emti ¹

Abstract:

This research aims to determine the level of effectiveness of workforce training and the motivation of its participants, as well as to assess the influence of participants' motivation on the training effectiveness at the Workforce Training Center in Pekanbaru City. The sample was selected using a proportional random sampling technique, comprising 104 respondents who participated in the training program at the Workforce Training Center. The data were analyzed using a descriptive method, and a quantitative approach with a simple linear regression equation was employed to measure the influence of the studied variables. The results indicate that participants' motivation at the training center generally falls below the good category. This is attributed to the participants' lack of awareness of the need for personal achievement in their lives, often relying on their parents for responsibility. Notably, participants from outside Pekanbaru exhibit better learning motivation. Additionally, the training effectiveness is also not rated as good, as evidenced by the participants' limited positive reactions during the program, resulting in unachieved behavioral changes and training goals. Hypothesis testing confirms that participants' motivation significantly influences training effectiveness at the Workforce Training Center.

Keywords: Motivation, Effectiveness, Workforce Training

1. Introduction

The long-term development of human resources faced by the younger generation is increasingly crucial. In today's global competition, companies require a workforce that is well-prepared (Nafukho et al. 2023). This intense competition has given rise to various issues, with unemployment being a prominent challenge faced by the government of Pekanbaru City. The primary cause of elevated unemployment in this area stems from the low competitiveness of prospective workers.

Consequently, the matter of local workers has become a focal point for the regional government in the context of implementing regional autonomy. The government has enacted various regulations, such as Government Policy Number 4 of 2002 concerning the placement of local workers. It emphasizes that local workers have not been optimally utilized by various companies and business units operating in the Pekanbaru

¹ Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences, Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau, Indonesia. desvi.emty@uin-suska.ac.id

City area. Consequently, it is essential to regulate the employment of local workers. Failure to optimize their utilization may lead to various negative impacts, including economic inequality, social jealousy, and a reduction in job opportunities for local workers.

The Workforce Training Center in Pekanbaru City is a technical unit under the Riau Province Manpower and Transmigration Service, providing education and training for various vocations. To cultivate skilled workforces, the training used by the Workforce Training Centre employs an education and training method comprising 25% theory and 75% practical application. The training primarily focuses on preparing and enhancing skills, knowledge, and job readiness. Participants can engage in planned training, enabling them not only to excel in the workforce but also to develop themselves for potential entrepreneurship. The education program at the Workforce Training Centre spans 9 months, including 6 months of training and 3 months of internship.

The training implementation at the Workforce Training Centre collaborates with various parties such as government agencies, companies, plantations, hotels, and others. This collaboration aims to provide apprentices with practical experience after acquiring skills for a year. Additionally, it is linked to the selection process for prospective participants in internships and workforce placement. The Workforce Training Centre has formed an integrated team comprising representatives from related institutions, the Pekanbaru City Manpower Office, the Workforce Training Centre, and the Hotel Association of Indonesia, or other workforce user partners.

Based on observations and data from the Manpower Office, it is known that out of the 348 workers who participated in the training program, only 27% immediately secured employment or started their own businesses. Meanwhile, the remaining participants continued their education at the university level, and some remained unemployed. Additionally, some training alumni did not apply the skills acquired through the training, indicating that the training they received tends to be underutilized, hindering efforts to reduce unemployment in the local area.

In addition to the perceived lack of benefits for the workforce and the government in reducing unemployment, attention must be given to behavioral issues, such as independent living behaviour (Giran et al. 2014). The training aims to cultivate a workforce with an independent spirit whose skills enable them to create their own employment opportunities (Duerden et al. 2014; Ozkeser 2019). Thus, it is anticipated that the workforce graduating from the Workforce Training Centre will not merely remain idle but will proactively shape their destinies.

The implementation of training at the Workforce Training Centre involves collaboration with various stakeholders, including government agencies, companies, plantations, hotels, and others (Gheitani et al. 2019). This collaboration serves apprentices after acquiring skills for a year and is also linked to the selection of prospective participants for internships and workforce placement. The Workforce Training Centre has established an integrated team comprising representatives from

related institutions, the City's Manpower Office, the Workforce Training Centre, and the Hotel Association of Indonesia, or other workforce user partners.

Motivation plays a crucial role in the learning process, and two motivational theories—Abraham Maslow's motivation theory and David McClelland's motivation theory—will be employed in this study. These theories will serve as a basis for analyzing educational problems in Indonesia. Maslow's theory posits that individuals have a hierarchy of needs, ranging from basic to the highest, where basic needs must be met before fulfilling higher-order needs (Niati et al. 2021). In the realm of education, to boost student motivation, educational institutions must prioritize meeting the basic needs of their students. Meanwhile, McClelland's theory focuses on issues related to success (the need to achieve). The Achievement Motivation Theory suggests that individuals with a strong desire to achieve something exhibit characteristics such as deriving satisfaction from their work and being highly interested in their own success (Agyapomaa et al. 2020). Applying McClelland's theory involves increasing the training participants' need for achievement. With a high need for achievement, participants are more motivated to overcome obstacles and challenges to achieve the learning goals of the training (Riyanto et al. 2021; Manzoor et al. 2019).

Despite the existing studies on workforce training effectiveness, there is a research gap in understanding the underutilization of skills acquired during training programs and its impact on local employment (Nguyen & Shao 2019; Clements & Kamau 2018; Gheitani et al. 2019; Jain et al. 2021). This study seeks to address this gap by investigating the factors contributing to the underutilization of skills and proposing strategies to enhance the effectiveness of workforce training programs.

The novelty of this research lies in its focus on both the quantitative analysis of training outcomes and the qualitative exploration of behavioral aspects, particularly independent living behavior. By incorporating motivational theories such as Maslow's hierarchy of needs and McClelland's Achievement Motivation Theory, the study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of the factors influencing workforce training effectiveness.

2. Theoretical Background

Training

Training and education are not exactly synonymous; however, there are identifiable similarities between them. Both aim to assist employees in their development, enabling them to reach higher levels of intelligence, knowledge, and skills. While education leans toward theoretical aspects, training prioritizes immediate application, making it more practical (Hang 2021). The presence of training or education ensures the availability of personnel in the company with expertise, and individuals who undergo training or education can apply critical thinking. Additionally, training contributes to employee stability and motivates them to provide their services for an extended period.

Training activities focus on enhancing specific skills or abilities required for a particular job. This ensures that employees can perform their designated tasks effectively based on the provided training (Dhabuwala & Pitroda 2021). Vocational training has consistently raised concerns about social inclusion, often operating as a facility for the already well-qualified, and well-funded opportunities may be accessible to those with the best qualifications (Mogea 2023).

Training Effectiveness

In the context of training, effectiveness can be defined as the level of achievement in a program with a set of goals. In simple terms, effectiveness is a comparison of outcomes with output (Jain et al. 2021). In other words, effectiveness is a measure of the success or failure of a training program in achieving its goals. If the program succeeds in achieving its goals, then the training is said to be running effectively. The most important emphasis that needs to be realized is that effectiveness does not state how much money has been spent to achieve the goal (Akther & Rahman 2022). Costs may exceed what was budgeted, they could even be three times bigger than what was budgeted. Therefore, effectiveness only looks at whether a program or activity has achieved its stated goals. Achieving results (effectiveness) should be carried out by an organization so that a program can run effectively consists of three stages, namely input and results or outcomes. Input includes all policy designs, commitments, and available resources (Rodgers et al. 2020).

Motivation

Motivation is importance in a training program because it causes and supports changes in human behavior (Dora et al. 2020). The motivated training participants are willing to learn and work more diligently and enthusiastically to achieve optimal results. Motivation is increasingly important because leaders distribute work to their subordinates so that it is done well and integrated towards the desired goals. The desire for recognition, respect and social status is the last type of need that drives people to work. Thus, every worker has certain motives, desires and needs and expects satisfaction from the results of their work. One of the well-known motivation theories is the theory of Abraham Maslow. The essence of Maslow's theory is that it is based on a hierarchy of five human needs (Maslow, 1999; Sugiarti 2022), namely physiological needs, safety security needs, social needs, esteem needs, and self-actualization needs. The hierarchy of the needs is depicted in a pyramid, in this case at the base of the pyramid are the needs to cover deficiencies, and at the top of the pyramid are the needs to grow (Niati et al. 2021).

3. Methodology

This descriptive research employs a quantitative approach with a sampling method utilizing the proportional random sampling technique. The research sample comprises training participants who engaged in the training program at the Workforce Training Centre. Primary data were collected directly by distributing and collecting questionnaires from the participants, followed by interviews.

The sample size was calculated based on Arikunto's sample theory, representing 30% of the total population. Using this formula resulted in a total of 104 respondents selected based on major groups. Consequently, the total sample size for this research was determined to be 104 respondents.

The instrument used for data collection was a questionnaire directed to research respondents, as detailed in Table 2.

Table 2. Blue Print of the Questionnaire

Variable	Indicator	Statements
Motivation of the Participants (X)	Achievement	1. The desire to improve abilities 2. The desire to increase knowledge 3. The desire to achieve success goals
	Recognition	1. The desire to get attention 2. The desire to gain recognition 3. The desire to be appreciated
	Work it self	1. The desire to be more expert 2. The desire to achieve satisfaction 3. The desire to prove yourself
	Responsibility	1. As is a moral burden 2. As a personal responsibility
	Advancement	1. The desire to self-improvement 2. The desire to life better
The Training Effectiveness (Y)	Reaction	1. The offered knowledge 2. The provided time 3. The instructor of the traning 4. The existing facilities
	Learning	1. The given theory 2. The practical events 3. The implementation of internship program
	Behaviour	1. Changes in discipline 2. Working methods mastery 3. Changes of attitudes
	Outcome	1. Using the skills they have 2. Earning additional income 3. Achieving better work results 4. Contribution to the environment

Source: The researcher's data analysis (2019)

The data analysis technique in answering the research problems and questions was the descriptive method. Through the method, it can describe all the facts obtained from the field. After interviews were conducted with the participants, the results were then transcribed in narrative form. And then, the researcher readjusted the categories based on the variables that had been compiled. After that, to measure the influence of the two studied variables, a quantitative approach with a simple linear regression equation was used.

4. Empirical Findings/Result

The Participants' Motivation during the Training at the BPTK

The participants, in this case, are workers—residents currently employed, seeking employment, or engaging in other activities. Labor represents a population with the potential to produce goods or services. In Indonesia, individuals aged 10 years and above are considered workers. If someone is under 10 years old, they cannot be classified as workers. Motivation stems from the basic word "motive," signifying encouragement, cause, or reason for someone to undertake an action. The motivation measurements employed in the research encompass achievement, recognition, the work itself, responsibility, and advancement.

Table 3 presents the participants' responses to questions concerning their motivation and the training effectiveness at the Workforce Training Centre.

Table 3. The Participants' Motivation on the Training Effectiveness at the Workforce Training Center

No.	Statements on	Responses					Total
		SA	A	NA	D	SD	
1	Improving the achievement	7 6.4%	51 48.7%	31 29.5%	16 15.4%	0 0.0%	104 100.0%
2	Getting recognition	0 0.0%	30 28.8%	43 41.7%	23 22.4%	7 7.1%	104 100.0%
3	Being more independent	0 0.0%	21 20.5%	30 28.8%	36 34.9%	16 15.7%	104 100.0%
4	Being more responsible	0 0.0%	21 20.5%	30 28.8%	36 34.9%	16 15.7%	104 100.0%
5	Getting advancement	0 0.0%	18 17.3%	36 34.6%	42 40.4%	8 7.7%	104 100.0%
Total		7	141	170	154	48	520
Mean		1	28	34	31	10	104
Percentage		1.3%	27.2%	32.7%	29.6%	9.2%	100.0%

Note : SA (Strongly Agree), A (Agree), NA (Neither Agree), D (Disagree), and SD (Strongly Disagree)

Source: Data Processed (2023)

Based on this data, it is evident that participants' motivation to engage in training at the Workforce Training Centre (formerly BPTK) is generally indicated as disagree (32.7%). Their participation in training is more driven by the workforce's need for achievement in their life and a sense of responsibility towards themselves, rather than seeking recognition, advancement, or independence. The participants' motivation for taking part in training is not to enhance their performance; rather, it is primarily to fill their free time. They do not seek recognition from others, and their participation in training is not driven by a desire for independence. Instead, it is influenced by parental guidance, resulting in a low sense of responsibility, and the achieved changes remain highly dependent on their parents.

The Effectiveness of Training at Workforce Training Centre

Training is a teaching and learning process that employs specific techniques and methods to enhance the work skills and abilities of an individual (employee or a group of people). Effectiveness is the level of achievement of program results

within set targets. In simpler terms, effectiveness involves comparing outcomes with outputs. In other words, it serves as a measure of the success or failure of an organization in accomplishing its goals. The evaluation of training effectiveness encompasses the assessment of reactions, learning, behavior, and training outcomes.

Table 4 presents the respondents' responses to questions regarding the effectiveness of training at the Workforce Training Centre in Pekanbaru City.

Table 4. The Participants' Responses on the Effectiveness of Training at the Workforce Training Center

No.	Statements on	Responses					Total
		VG	G	F	P	VP	
1	Reaction	0 0.0%	41 39.2%	43 41.3%	17 16.3%	3 3.1%	104 100.0%
2	Learning	10 9.6%	45 43.6%	30 29.2%	18 17.6%	0 0.0%	104 100.0%
3	Behaviour	4 3.5%	29 27.6%	48 46.2%	21 20.5%	2 2.2%	104 100.0%
4	Outcome	7 6.5%	24 22.8%	52 49.8%	21 20.4%	1 0.5%	104 100.0%
Total		20	139	173	78	6	416
Mean		5	35	43	19	2	104
Percentage		4.9%	33.3%	41.6%	18.7%	1.5%	100.0%

Note : VG (Very Good), G (Good), F (Fair), P (Poor), and VP (Very Poor)

Source: Data Processed (2023)

Based on the presented data, it is evident that the effectiveness of training at the Workforce Training Centre in Pekanbaru City is not categorized as good (38.2%). This indicates that the training provided to participants at the Workforce Training Centre is subpar. The highest-rated aspect was the learning conditions received by respondents concerning theory with practice, where a combination of 25% theory and 75% practice yielded greater value in absorbing the provided skills. Conversely, the lowest-rated aspect was behavior change, signifying that the participants' acquired behaviors during training were still not effectively applied in the real world.

Regression Coefficient Analysis

This analysis is used to measure the magnitude of the influence of participant motivation on training effectiveness. The results of data processing using SPSS 16 can be presented in Table 5.

Table 5. Results of Multiple Linear Regression Analysis

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	1.614	.287		5.613	.000
Participant Motivation	.527	.093	.488	5.646	.000

Source: Data Processed SPSS (2023)

Examining Table 5, the multiple regression results yield the following regression equation:

$$Y = 1.614 + 0.527 X + e$$

The interpretation of the simple linear regression equation is as follows:

- The value of α (1.614) represents the effectiveness of training when participant motivation is absent or equal to zero.
- The value of β (0.527) signifies that participant motivation positively influences training effectiveness. In other words, the higher the participant's motivation in engaging with the training, the more effective the training is likely to be.

t-Test Analysis

The t-test is used to measure the hypothesis set, the hypothesis set is as follows: It is suspected that participant motivation has an influence on the effectiveness of workforce training at the Workforce Training Centre in Pekanbaru City, measurement is carried out by following the steps for testing the hypothesis, determining measurement criteria, determining the t-table value, calculated t-values, decisions, and conclusions.

Table 6.
Partial Test (t-Test)

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	1.614	.287		5.613	.000
Participant Motivation	.527	.093	.488	5.646	.000

Source: Data Processed SPSS (2023)

Based on Table 6 about the calculations using SPSS (Statistical Package for Social Science) program, it is known that the calculated t-value for the training participant motivation variable is = 5.646. The t-table values is 1.980. The decision is taken by comparing the calculated t with the t table, as follows $5.646 > 1.980$. From this comparison, it can be seen that the calculated t value is greater than the table t value. So, it can be decided that H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted. Based on the results of the measurements which were carried out, it can be concluded and proven that the motivation of participants to take part in training has an influence on the effectiveness of training at the Workforce Training Centre in Pekanbaru City.

Coefficient of Determination Test (R^2)

Table 7.
Coefficient of Determination Test (R^2)

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.488 ^a	.238	.231	.40457

Source: Data Processed SPSS (2023)

Based on Table 7, it can be concluded that the correlation value (R) obtained is 0.488 and it can be concluded that there is a strong influence between the independent variable and the dependent. The R square value of 0.238 or 23,8% shows that the influence of participant motivation in influencing training effectiveness is 23,8%,

while the remaining 76,2% is influenced by other variables that were not included and were not used by researchers in this research.

5. Discussion

The research findings reveal that participants' motivation for engaging in training at the Workforce Training Centre is below the optimal level (32.7%). Participants often enroll not to enhance their performance but merely to fill free time, as suggested by one interviewee who mentioned being compelled by parents due to university admission failure. The lack of intrinsic motivation leads to low commitment and minimal achievement. External influences, such as parental pressure, emerge as significant factors steering participants towards training. A participant admitted, "I took part because my parents ordered me to." This external drive undermines the participants' commitment and responsibility, aligning with Nawawi's observation on workers' diverse motivations within an organization.

Moreover, the study identifies varying motivations among participants. While 55% aim to improve work performance, others join for diverse reasons, including filling free time (32.7%) and seeking recognition (28.8%). External pressure and parental influence remain notable factors, impacting participants' attitudes toward training (Wiradendi Wolor et al. 2020). Analysis by age and education level sheds light on these variations. Teenagers and high school participants may lack a profound interest in self-improvement, while older participants demonstrate a desire to broaden knowledge and achieve personal growth (Park et al. 2020).

The research assesses the effectiveness of the training, revealing that only 38.2% consider it effective. Despite balanced theory-practice ratios, the observed behavioral changes are not translating effectively into real-world applications. Instructors express concerns about participants' unchanged behavior and discipline, attributing it to the less selective participant selection process. Participants' reactions to the training program exhibit a mixed response (39.2%). Negative reactions surface regarding factors such as inadequate time, instructors, and facilities, highlighting the need for improvements in these areas. Responses regarding lessons learned indicate a positive outcome (53.2%). Participants appreciate the relevance of lessons to current workplace needs, emphasizing practical learning and internships. However, negative feedback persists due to limitations in training facilities. While participants acknowledge the lessons, behavioral changes based on acquired knowledge remain modest (31.1%). The positive impact on the organization is limited (29.3%), with noticeable differences among participants from within and outside Pekanbaru City.

Statistical analysis confirms that participants' motivation significantly influences training effectiveness. This aligns with existing literature, emphasizing motivation as an internal drive that energizes individuals toward goal achievement.

In conclusion, the research underscores the need for a more intrinsic and personal motivation among participants to enhance training effectiveness. Additionally,

improvements in training facilities, participant selection processes, and program design could contribute to better outcomes.

6. Conclusions

In conclusion, the research findings indicate that the motivation of participants at the Workforce Training Centre (formerly BPTK) is not within the optimal category. The participants' inclination to engage in training lacks a foundation in a conscious pursuit of personal achievement, and a considerable number still rely heavily on parental influence. Notably, participants originating from outside the city exhibit a comparatively higher motivation for progress.

The effectiveness of the training programs offered at the Workforce Training Centre falls short of expectations. The training provided to prospective workers does not align adequately with current job market needs, contributing to a suboptimal learning experience. Participants' lukewarm reactions to the training program further hinder the achievement of behavioral changes and tangible results in the field. The perceived insignificance and lack of personal volition contribute to this challenge.

While participants' motivation contributes to training effectiveness by 23.8%, other factors, including management practices and parental support, play pivotal roles. Statistical analysis at a 95% confidence level validates the significance of participants' motivation, with a rejection of the null hypothesis. This implies a confirmed influence of participants' motivation on training effectiveness at the Workforce Training Centre.

Limitations of this study include the exclusive focus on participant motivation and the training center's effectiveness, overlooking broader organizational and societal aspects. Future research should explore comprehensive factors impacting training outcomes, considering organizational strategies, societal perceptions, and participant demographics. Additionally, a longitudinal study tracking participants' progress over time could provide deeper insights into the sustainability of training effects and long-term career development.

References:

- Agyapomaa, A., Pramfi, E. A., & Korsah, L. A. (2020). Examining the Impact of HRM Practices on Employees' Motivation at the Methodist College of Education. *ADRRJ Journal of Arts and Social Sciences*, 17(5 (5)), 47-72.
- Akther, S., & Rahman, M. S. (2022). Investigating training effectiveness of public and private banks employees in this digital age: an empirical study. *International Journal of Manpower*, 43(2), 542-568.
- Clements, A. J., & Kamau, C. (2018). Understanding students' motivation towards proactive career behaviours through goal-setting theory and the job demands-resources model. *Studies in Higher Education*, 43(12), 2279-2293.
- Dhabuwala, P. A., & Pitroda, J. R. (2021). Recruitment, selection and training of human resource in construction: a review. *Reliability: Theory & Applications*, 16(SI 1 (60)), 111-120.
- Dora, Y. M., NurAmalina, H., & AuliaRahmi, F. (2020). The Role Of Training, Motivation And Facilities To Improve The Capability Of Smes In Using Digital

- Marketing. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 17(10), 3942-3951.
- Duerden, M. D., Witt, P., Garst, B., Bialeschki, D., Schwarzlose, T., & Norton, K. (2014). The Impact of Camp Employment on the Workforce Development of Emerging Adults. *Journal of Park & Recreation Administration*, 32(1).
- Gheitani, A., Imani, S., Seyyedamiri, N., & Foroudi, P. (2019). Mediating effect of intrinsic motivation on the relationship between Islamic work ethic, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment in banking sector. *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management*, 12(1), 76-95.
- Giran, H., Amin, A., & Halim, B. A. (2014). The impact of self-efficacy towards training motivation at Kolej Poly-Tech MARA Kuantan, Malaysia. *Asian Social Science*, 10(19), 69.
- Hang, N. T. (2021). Educating and training labor force under Covid 19: Impacts to meet market demand in Vietnam during globalization and integration era. *JETT*, 12(1), 179-184.
- Jain, G., Sharma, N., & Shrivastava, A. (2021). Enhancing training effectiveness for organizations through blockchain-enabled training effectiveness measurement (BETEM). *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 34(2), 439-461.
- Manzoor, F., Wei, L., Bányai, T., Nurunnabi, M., & Subhan, Q. A. (2019). An examination of sustainable HRM practices on job performance: An application of training as a moderator. *Sustainability*, 11(8), 2263.
- Mogea, T. (2023). The Importance of Human Resources Training to Improve Organizational Performance. *CENDEKIA: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial, Bahasa dan Pendidikan*, 3(2), 58-72.
- Nafukho, F. M., Irby, B. J., Pashmforoosh, R., Lara-Alecio, R., Tong, F., Lockhart, M. E., ... & Wang, Z. (2023). Training design in mediating the relationship of participants' motivation, work environment, and transfer of learning. *European Journal of Training and Development*, 47(10), 112-132.
- Niati, D. R., Siregar, Z. M. E., & Prayoga, Y. (2021). The effect of training on work performance and career development: the role of motivation as intervening variable. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4(2), 2385-2393.
- Nguyen, L. T., & Shao, Y. (2019). The impact of training on turnover intention: the role of growth need strength among Vietnamese female employees. *The South East Asian Journal of Management*.
- Ozkeser, B. (2019). Impact of training on employee motivation in human resources management. *Procedia Computer Science*, 158, 802-810.
- Park, D. S., Zhang, Y., Jia, Y., Han, W., Chiu, C. C., Li, B., ... & Le, Q. V. (2020). Improved noisy student training for automatic speech recognition. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2005.09629*.
- Riyanto, S., Endri, E., & Herlisha, N. (2021). Effect of work motivation and job satisfaction on employee performance: Mediating role of employee engagement. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 19(3), 162.
- Rodgers, S., Wang, Z., & Schultz, J. C. (2020). A scale to measure science communication training effectiveness. *Science Communication*, 42(1), 90-111.
- Sugiarti, E. (2022). The Influence of Training, Work Environment and Career Development on Work Motivation That Has an Impact on Employee Performance at PT. Suryamas Elsindo Primatama In West Jakarta. *International Journal of Artificial Intelligence Research*, 6(1).
- Wiradendi Wolor, C., Solikhah, S., Fidhyallah, N. F., & Lestari, D. P. (2020). Effectiveness of e-training, e-leadership, and work life balance on employee performance during COVID-19. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(10).