
Competency Development Strategy for Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) within the Regional Government of West Maluku Regency

Evrina Reiper¹, Hamka², Mala Sondang Silitonga³

Abstract:

The purpose of this research is to determine the competence of the Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) within the Regional Government of Southwest Maluku Regency, and to develop a strategy for developing the competence of the Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) within the Government of Southwest Maluku Regency. The research method that researchers use in conducting this research is a descriptive research method with a qualitative approach. The results showed that the competence of the Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) within the Regional Government of Southwest Maluku Regency has high motivation in carrying out the duties of the position, as seen from the services provided to auditees. However, the opportunity to participate in self-development is not yet in accordance with the duties of the position. New tasks or jobs are completed based on GISA motivation. The average GISA HR has a good nature, not easily influenced by the environment. Eager to carry out tasks, do not compromise with personal policies from the auditee. Self-concept, character and motivation are hidden in each person and are difficult to develop through training programs, but will be formed and developed from the length of time a person carries out certain tasks. The longer GISA HR occupies a supervisory position can help him to get better. However, to know the auditee's personality, GISA needs special training related to psychology. In general, GISA's knowledge is quite good, but specifically GISA's knowledge related to their job duties is still lacking, development is needed for each individual GISA. The skills dimension relates to technical competence. The development of technical competence for GISA on a regular basis is able to create GISAs who are skilled in carrying out their duties. Competency development strategies that have been carried out for GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency by conducting professional skill training, job enrichment, comparative studies, and building teamwork.

Keywords: Development, competence, Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA)

1. Introduction

Being competent according to the law means continuing to learn and develop capabilities. This includes increasing self-competence to respond to ever-changing challenges, helping others learn, carrying out tasks with the best quality. In addition,

¹Politeknik STIA LAN Jakarta, Indonesia. 1981evrina@gmail.com

²Politeknik STIA LAN Jakarta, Indonesia. laicahamka@gmail.com

³Politeknik STIA LAN Jakarta, Indonesia. malasondangs@stialan.ac.id

ASN is entitled to receive awards and recognition. The awards and recognition referred to, two of which are motivational awards in the form of financial and non-financial and self-development in the form of talent and career development and/or competency development. Talent and career development and competency development are also 2 of the 8 minimum ASN management. The implementation of talent and career development for ASN is carried out by considering qualifications, competencies, performance and agency needs. Every ASN is required to develop competence through continuous learning to remain relevant to the demands of the organization. This can be done through an integrated learning system, where the learning process is integrated with work.

According to Rivai et al., (2015) ASN competency development is a method used by agencies to provide the best service through education and training. Quality apparatus resources are a prerequisite in improving the quality of state and government administration to the community. And in order for every coaching effort towards improving the quality of government apparatus to achieve the target and be relevant in responding to the demands of reform in achieving competency standards for structural, functional and non-service staff / employees, a strategy is needed in achieving this. Citing the results of research conducted by Adrianto (2019) He found that the competency development program for ASNs provided in the form of education and training to improve their knowledge, skills and abilities in carrying out their duties to serve the community had a positive impact on improving their individual performance.

Meanwhile, from the results of research conducted by Bakri (2019) on Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) employees at the Inspectorate of Takalar Regency, South Sulawesi, he found that low HR competence is an obstacle in doing his job. According to him, with the increased capability of GISA, it is expected to improve the performance of the Inspectorate of Takalar Regency, North Sulawesi, which in turn will realize a professional and quality GISA for improving public services and accountable government.

From what was conveyed by the two researchers above, the researchers can say that the competency development program for ASN both in the form of education and training is carried out to be able to improve its competence, be it related to knowledge, skills and abilities in carrying out the duties carried out. ASN with low competence will be an obstacle in carrying out tasks. Increasing the capability/competence of each GISA can automatically improve the performance of the OPD, in this case the Inspectorate.

2. Theoretical Background

Competency Development Strategy

Human resources as a driving element in the organization are required to continue to improve their competence to realize organizational targets or goals. According to Jacobs (1989) Competence is a person's skill or ability to complete a task "well". The purpose of carrying out the task well is the emphasis related to effective and efficient. Effective and efficient in the implementation of work is determined by the ability of human resources which includes aspects of knowledge, skills in attitude, cooperation, problem solving and other abilities. Competencies for each HR can be obtained through work experience, life experience, study, or training.

Hasibuan (2008) suggests that competency development is an effort to improve the knowledge, technical ability and morale of employees in accordance with job needs and this can be done through leveling education and various types of training. Education is directed to improve science in order to have a broader insight and a critical and analytical mindset. While training is intended to improve technical skills to support the implementation of tasks. From the above opinion, researchers can convey that competency development is one of the efforts to improve knowledge, skills and abilities for HR in organizations according to job needs, this can be done through education and training.

Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA)

Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 35 of 2018 concerning the Supervision Policy for Local Government Implementation in 2019, Article 1 point 3, it is said that the Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus, hereinafter abbreviated as GISA, is the Inspectorate General of Ministries, Supervision Units of Non-Ministerial Government Institutions, Provincial Regional Inspectorates, and District/City Regional Inspectorates.

In Government Regulation Number 60 of 2008 concerning the Government Internal Control System hereinafter abbreviated as SPIP, Article 48 paragraph (2) states that the Government Internal Control Apparatus conducts internal supervision through the implementation of audit, review, evaluation, monitoring and other supervisory activities. Furthermore, in Article 49 paragraph (6), it is stated that the District/City Inspectorate supervises all activities in the context of carrying out the duties and functions of the district/city regional apparatus work unit funded by the district/city Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget.

3. Methodology

Researchers as key instruments in this study, as well as the research methods that researchers use in conducting this research are descriptive research methods with a

qualitative approach. The data collection techniques used in this study were interviews, observations and document studies.

4. Empirical Findings/Result

GISA Competence of Southwest Maluku Regency

According to Spencer and Spencer (1993), competence is defined as "A competency is an underlying characteristic of an individual that is causally related to criterion-referenced effective and/or superior performance in a job or situation", meaning that competence is the main characteristic of an individual related to performance effectiveness or superior performance in a job and in a certain situation. The main characteristic means that competence is a person's personality that is quite deep and is a part that is forever in a person. In the context of the discussion related to GISA competence, Southwest Maluku Regency uses the competency development approach offered by Spencer and Spencer (1993) related to the basic characteristics of competence, namely the development of dimensions of motivation, nature, self-concept, knowledge and expertise, and is also elaborated with regulations governing ASN and ASN competence.

Dimensions of Motivation

Referring to the ideas of Robert Kreitner and Angelo Kinicki (2001: 205) suggest that motivation can certainly affect performance, although it is not the only factor that shapes performance. One of the factors that affect performance is the motivation factor formed from the attitude of an employee in dealing with work situations. Mental attitude itself is a mental condition that encourages employees to strive to achieve maximum work performance. The mental attitude of an employee must be psychosiphysically prepared (mentally ready, physically, goals and situations). This means that an employee must be mentally prepared, as well as physically, understand the main goals and work targets to be achieved, as well as be able to utilize and create work situations. Based on the data obtained, GISA competency development outside the auditor formation training, the type of education and training that has been followed as risk management training; training on optimizing technical improvement of RKA planning, SKPD programs and activities; training on the martyrdom assessment of SPIP Local Government; LK Local Government review training; compliance audit training; training on procurement of goods and services; performance audit training; training to increase the use of domestic production; investigative audit training; training of the village financial supervision system; DAK management training; risk-based internal audit training; and training on the implementation of accrual-based government accounting systems with SIMDA.

While the types of GISA competency development training that have not been followed by GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency are computer-aided audit

techniques; supervisory management; risk-based supervisory planning; probity audit of goods and services procurement; GISA capability assessment; preparation of internal audit working papers; risk-based performance audit; evaluation of SAKIP implementation audit or PAD; OPAD evaluation; review of internal control of financial reporting; internal audit refreshment; village asset management; and preparation of local government financial reports.

From the data above, it can be seen that there are still many types of training that have not been attended by GISA human resources in Southwest Maluku Regency to support the implementation of their job duties. Talking about the motivation of employees, this is inseparable from how the leader's role in providing encouragement/motivation for his subordinates. Motivated employees automatically have an impact on improving competence and performance. The facts found by researchers, in the context of motivating GISA in Southwest Maluku, what the leadership does is by means of performance dialog packed in a meeting event in addition to evaluation, hearing suggestions, input from GISA both in the form of individuals and in the form of groups.

In addition to the performance dialog, leaders also motivate GISA by providing opportunities for them to participate in self-development activities, although these self-development activities are still far from what is needed because they are related to the various tasks they carry out. Talking about competency development and the demands of GISA's tasks, this is related to the technical competencies that must be possessed by human resources in the duties of the GISA position. This is in line with the mandate of PP Number 17 of 2020 concerning Civil Servant Management. Technical competence is knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured and developed specifically related to the technical field of the position.

There is an interesting thing that researchers found, that every success achieved in carrying out tasks both by GISA individuals and groups, not all of them were rewarded or compensated by the leadership. It appears that the leadership's appreciation or recognition of GISA who have successfully carried out their work has not been fully implemented. In Law Number 20 of 2023 concerning ASN, mandates that ASN employees are entitled to receive appreciation and recognition in the form of material or non-material. Components include income, recognition in the form of motivation.

In increasing GISA's motivation to work, a harmonious relationship between GISA is needed. Here the role of the leader is also very much needed. This is important because in carrying out their duties, GISA does not work individually but as part of a work team. A solid work team automatically fosters motivation in working so that even difficult work is considered easy and requires a short working time. From this opinion, it can be seen that the leader as the person in control has not fully controlled the work and also the lack of self-control of each member in conflict. If this

continues, it is possible that work motivation will decrease. To anticipate something like this, self-development is needed. The type of development that is considered suitable and needed is managerial competency development. In Permenpan RB Number 38 of 2017 concerning ASN Position Competencies, managerial competencies are knowledge, skills and attitudes/behaviors that can be observed, measured and developed to lead and/or manage organizational units.

Working conditions also influence GISA's work motivation. Working conditions are everything that is around, which can influence in carrying out the tasks assigned. The role of leadership is also needed in creating good and comfortable working conditions for GISA. A good, safe and comfortable working environment will increase work motivation. Based on what the researchers found, GISA's working conditions in Southwest Maluku are good. Quoting Handoko, who stated that the work environment is all forms of atmosphere around workers that can affect workers in carrying out the tasks assigned to them. (Handoko, 2002: 193). From what the informants said and the expert's opinion, it can be seen that there is self-awareness from each GISA to create good, safe and comfortable working conditions. These working conditions influence GISA in carrying out the tasks assigned to them.

Trait Dimensions

Spencer and Spencer (2013), interpret traits as a form of mental characteristics and consistency of a person's response to stimuli, pressures, situations, or information. This is emphasized by Marshall (2003: 40) who said that disposition is a characteristic that is rooted in a person and reflects his tendencies. The two expert opinions above, if related to the nature or character of GISA in the Southwest Maluku Regency, then this is related to socio-cultural competence. Policies related to mandating socio-cultural competence are knowledge, skills, and attitudes / behaviors that can be observed, measured and developed related to the experience of interacting with plural people or society in general in terms of religion, ethnicity and culture, behavior, national insight, ethics, moral values, emotions and principles that must be fulfilled by each office holder to obtain work results in accordance with the roles and functions of the position.

An interesting thing that researchers found is that, in the context of GISA competency development, there are no specific activities carried out to be related to competency development to shape the nature or character of GISA. Their nature or disposition will change according to the environment in which they exist and work. For the development of socio-cultural competition for GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency does not need to be done, because on average they have good properties, easily adjust to the environment, are not easily influenced by bad things. However, when related to socio-cultural competencies mandated in existing policies, it can be said that the development of socio-cultural competencies for GISA is needed

because their task is not only to dwell in the area of Southwest Maluku Regency, but at any time they will interact with plural communities out there.

Culturally, we have a stereotype that the nature or character of humans in eastern Indonesia are individuals who are hard, difficult to compromise and have high emotions and temperament. The trait dimensions offered by Spencer and Spencer (2013) are in line with the ideas of intellectual competence offered by (Nahapiet and Ghoshal 1998) and Zohar and Marshall (2000). Intellectual competence is the character of attitudes and behavior or the will and intellectual abilities of individuals (which can be in the form of knowledge, skills, professional understanding, contextual understanding, etc.) which are relatively stable when facing problems in the workplace, which are formed from the synergy between character and self-concept, internal motivation, and contextual knowledge capacity (Nahapiet and Ghoshal 1998). Zohar and Marshall (2000) stated that intellectual competence is the ability and will related to solving rational or strategic problems. Besides that, Robbins and Judge (2007) also say that intellectual competence is the ability needed to carry out mental activities.

Referring to expert opinion and the reality that occurs within the Southwest Maluku Regency Government, the GISA of the Southwest Maluku Regency Government actually has competence in the context of trait dimensions that are in line with the ideas of Spenser and Spenser (2013), because they are competent individuals who truly have personality traits that are typical of humans who are born with stereotypes as previously stated. To be able to increase their intellectual competence, it is necessary to develop harmonious competence, namely technical competence. Apart from that, the organizational culture factor is also closely related to the competencies possessed by these GISAs, the culture that is built makes their character and way of working unique and different from others.

Apart from being in line with technical competence, Spenser and Spenser's (2013) trait dimensions are also connected to the concept of managerial competence. Talking about managerial competency, we can see its limitations in the Regulation of the Minister for Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 38 of 2017 concerning Competency Standards for State Civil Service Positions. Managerial Competencies are knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behaviors that can be observed, measured, and developed to lead and/or manage organizational units. Managerial Competencies themselves are in accordance with existing national definitions and policies that refer to the competencies required for each GISA to carry out their managerial duties effectively.

In Law Number 20 of 2023 concerning ASN, it is stated that ASN positions are managerial positions and non-managerial positions. If it is related to managerial competence, it is clearly illustrated that managerial competence is only possessed by

ASN who occupy managerial positions. However, this Managerial Competency is normatively mandatory for GISAs to have in carrying out their job duties, because a GISA in carrying out his duties is not only carried out individually, but there are also tasks that must be carried out together (teamwork) so that managerial competence is considered important for every GISA . One form of managerial competence is cooperation. Within the scope of GISA, competencies related to the ability to collaborate are manifested in behavior when participating as a good team member, carrying out their duties/parts, and supporting team decisions; ability to listen and appreciate input from others and provide suggestions for the benefit of the team; and able to establish social interactions to complete tasks.

In order to foster the competence of a participative and effective work team, GISA MBD is also expected to be able to assist other people in completing their tasks to support team goals; Apart from that, being able to share relevant or useful information with team members; consider input and expertise of members in the team/work group and be willing to learn from others; and Building high commitment to completing team tasks. Based on expert opinion, informant opinions and the analysis that has been put forward, the competence of GISA in Southwest Maluku regarding dimensions can be said to be good. Changes in the nature of GISA individuals are adjusted to the environment in which they exist and work, but a bad environment cannot affect integrity at work.

Dimensions of Self-Concept

Referring to Spenser and Spenser's self-concept (2013), namely a system of noble values that is upheld by a person, which reflects one's self-image or attitude towards the desired future or towards a phenomenon that occurs in one's environment. Marshall (2003) also stated that self-concept is the image a person has of himself and this reflects his identity. Besides that, Kreitner and Kinicki (2003) state that self-concept is a person's self-perception as a physical, social and spiritual being.

Self-concept is an important aspect of a person's self, because a person's self-concept is a frame of reference, especially in interacting with the environment. The concept of self is phenomenological and says that when an individual perceives himself, reacts to himself, gives meaning and assessment and forms abstractions about himself, it means that he shows self-awareness and the ability to come out of himself to see himself as he does to the world outside himself.

When related to the type of competence, this self-concept is related to socio-cultural competence because it is related to how a person can perceive himself as a social being who always interacts with others in diversity. Self-concept is the image a person has about himself, formed through the experiences gained when the person interacts with the environment. Self-concept is not an innate factor but rather develops from continuous and differentiated experience. The results of the interview with this source turned out to be in line with the ideas of Feist (2013), where self-

concept is interpreted as all aspects of a person's existence and experience that the individual is aware of. Quoting what was conveyed by Spencer & Spencer (2013), the meaning of self-concept is a person's attitudes, values or self-image. Self-confidence is people's belief that they can be effective in almost any situation and is part of people's self-concept.

The development of the GISA self-concept, in general, has been carried out in the technical training activities that have been participated in, but specifically it has not been given a place in various GISA competency development activities. Based on the opinions of the informants and elaboration with existing theories, self-concept in the context of this competency is an individual's description of himself and his personality based on the way the individual interacts with other people and also experiences, not because it is innate. If the competency dimensions of Spencer & Spencer's (2013) perspective of self-concept are related to the GISA of the Government of Southwest Maluku and refer to the Regulation of the Minister for Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 38 of 2017 concerning Competency Standards for State Civil Apparatus Positions, then it can be included in the category socio-cultural competence.

Talking about the socio-cultural competence of GISA, Southwest Maluku Regency, we again refer to Permenpan RB Number 38 of 2017 concerning ASN Position Competency Standards. Socio-Cultural Competency is knowledge, skills and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured and developed related to the experience of interacting with a pluralistic society in terms of religion, ethnicity and culture, behavior, national insight, ethics, values, morals, emotions and principles, which must be fulfilled by every position holder to obtain work results in accordance with the role, function and position. Within the scope of GISA MBD, socio-cultural competence is reflected in attitudes related to sensitivity in understanding and accepting diversity, besides that it is also manifested in the form of actively developing attitudes of mutual respect, emphasizing equality and unity, actively promoting, developing attitudes of tolerance and unity, utilizing differences constructively. and be creative to increase organizational effectiveness, and most importantly become a government representative to build social psychological relationships.

Researchers ultimately agree with the ideas of Spencer & Spencer (2013), saying that self-concept, character traits and competency motives are more hidden, deep and different at the central point of a person's personality and also tend to be difficult to develop in training and development programs. Knowledge and skill competencies tend to be more obvious and relatively different on the surface as one of the characteristics possessed by humans and is easy to develop in training and human resource development programs. Referring to expert opinions, informant opinions and related policies, it can be said that GISA competencies related to

dimensions do not need to be developed because they will be formed by themselves from GISA's experience interacting with the environment.

Knowledge Dimensions

The idea of knowledge dimension competence initiated by Spenser and Spenser (2013) actually refers to a form of intellectual competence. Intellectual competence is the character of attitudes and behavior or the will and intellectual abilities of individuals (which can be in the form of knowledge, skills, professional understanding, contextual understanding, etc.) which are relatively stable when facing problems in the workplace, which is formed from the synergy between character, concept self, internal motivation, and contextual knowledge capacity (Nahapiet & Ghoshal, 1998: 245). Robbins & Judge (2007: 42) also say that intellectual competence is the ability needed to carry out mental activities.

From the expert opinion above, it can be said that a person's knowledge refers to the intellect they possess, this includes knowledge, skills, professional understanding, contextual understanding which are relative when doing work or facing problems in the workplace. Knowledge is formed from character, self-concept and motivation.

Referring to GISA's job duties, each GISA individual is required to have knowledge related to their job duties in carrying out their duties. Talking about the duties of the GISA position, this is closely related to the technical competence possessed. When each individual is given the responsibility to carry out a job, he must first be equipped with knowledge related to the job in question. To obtain harmonious knowledge, competency development is needed. GISA's job duties are functional job duties so they are related to GISA's technical competencies. Technical competency has been clearly stated in the regulations that govern it, it's just a matter of how stakeholders follow up.

Apart from the desire of each individual to increase their knowledge regarding their field of interest, in organizations the role of leadership also has a good impact in increasing the knowledge of employees. Employees who have appropriate knowledge will have an impact on the employee's own performance and the performance of the organization where he works.

In the context of GISA competency related to the knowledge dimension according to Spencer & Spencer, the Southwest Maluku Regency Government through the Inspector as GISA leader has tried to improve the competency of GISA, this implementation is carried out periodically every year. Every fiscal year there is a GISA that is included in competency development, the type of development is adjusted to the demands of the task, but not all types of developers are followed by GISA, in fact there are GISAs that have not had the opportunity at all. Apart from other internal constraints, the budget is the main constraint, the budget allocated for each fiscal year is very minimal. Knowledge is the main thing for a GISA in

carrying out their duties, because it is closely related to the demands of their position.

Spencer and Spencer (1993) define knowledge as the information a person has for a particular field. Sources of knowledge are obtained from the results of study (study, learning) and experience (experience) as well as intuition (intuition). Knowledge as the ability to complete certain tasks through learning. Learning is linking together data with information, experiences and attitudes that a person has.

From the theories put forward by experts, the opinions of informants and existing policies, it can be said that the competence of GISA in Southwest Maluku regarding the knowledge dimension shows that the technical competence of each GISA individual is still very minimal even though they are included in competency development every year. The lack of knowledge required means that GISA requires the development of technical competence related to the job duties held.

Skill Dimensions

Spencer and Spencer (1993) define skills as the ability to carry out a certain task both physically and mentally. Mental or cognitive skills competencies include analytical thinking (processing knowledge or data, determining cause and influence, organizing data and plans) and conceptual thinking. From the expert opinion above, it can be said that skills are the abilities a person has to carry out tasks both physically and mentally. The scope of mental skills or cognitive skills consists of analytical thinking and conceptual thinking. Analytical thinking includes how someone analyzes the knowledge or data they have so that they can determine what causes and what influence the data has in order to create an implementation plan. Conceptual thinking means how someone can think about and create a concept that will be expressed in writing or action.

The opinions of Sepnker and Spenser above, if related to the duties of the GISA position and the types of competencies available, are in line with technical competencies. In carrying out the duties of the GISA position, the final result of the implementation of each task item is in the form of a report or document that will be submitted to stakeholders for information and follow-up, so each GISA's ability to analyze data and the ability to create concepts is required. The report or document is expected to contain a narrative that is easy to read and understand by the auditee or other readers. It is important to note that the understanding of what is read by each auditee is different, so that the use of words and sentences can be adjusted to the location of the task for which GISA requires sufficient skills.

Skills are one of the main keys to completing tasks that must be inherent in GISA individuals. A person is said to be skilled if he continuously improves his abilities according to the field of work he is carrying out, this ability will be seen in the final

results of the work he is doing. Quoting what Spencer & Spencer said, skill is the ability to carry out a certain task both physically and mentally. From Spencer & Spencer's opinion, if the elaboration of competency for ASN is based on the mandate of Permenpan RB Number 38 of 2017 concerning ASN Position Competency Standards, then this opinion is in line with technical competency. Technical competency is knowledge, skills and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured and developed specifically related to the technical field of the position.

Skills have a relationship with technical competence. Continuous development of technical competence is able to create GISA who are skilled in carrying out work. GISA individual skills in completing work must be able to foster leadership trust. Skills gained from experience are also able to make GISA individuals more expert in decision making when assessing an opinion on the object being examined. There is a link between GISA's technical skills and competencies so that continuous development is necessary. Apart from that, the leadership has confidence in the skilled GISA and the decisions made cannot be separated from the experience that GISA has and even acts as motivation for GISA. Based on what has been conveyed regarding GISA competency in Southwest Maluku which is viewed from the Spencer & Spencer skill dimensions, elaborated with related policies and informant opinions, it can be said that GISA competency in Southwest Maluku needs to be developed periodically.

GISA Competency Development Strategy for Southwest Maluku Regency Professional Skills Training

The Southwest Maluku Regency Government, through the leadership of the technical OPD unit (Regional Inspectorate), each fiscal year prepares a number of budgets to finance activity programs related to competency development for GISA individuals. This is done through professional skills training activities. Every year there is a budget specifically allocated to finance competency development activities for GISA human resources in Southwest Maluku. The aim is to increase GISA skills or knowledge as it relates to the duties of the position. However, the budget to finance it is very minimal. From what is stated above, it can be said that the demands of GISA's duties are related to the technical competencies mandated in Permenpan RB Number 38 of 2017, technical competencies are knowledge, skills and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured and developed specifically related to the technical field. position. Meanwhile, the statement related to the level of GISA capability, according to the results of the GISA capability assessment in the Maluku and North Maluku regions, namely 44.97%, shows that GISA capability is low and one of the causes is the lack of competency development for GISA human resources.

Professional skills training through education and training carried out by Regional Apparatus in collaboration with government agencies, Regency/City regional apparatus, and/or accredited private institutions for GISA human resources has had a

good impact on GISA's performance. The performance of the relevant OPD is quite good. This statement is based on verbal services obtained and regional government performance report data for the relevant year. However, performance is quite good not for the services required in the form of letters, reports or documents which take a long time to complete, this is related to the number of human resources which is inversely proportional to the large number of task loads.

GISA's workload, which is their duties and responsibilities, is stated in Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 35 of 2018 concerning Policies for Supervision of Regional Government Implementation in 2019. To be able to carry out the tasks mentioned above, competency development is needed. This is in line with the mandate of PP Number 12 of 2017 concerning GISA Development and Supervision, Article 16 which reads; Supervision of Regional Government Implementation carried out by GISA must be based on existing competencies. GISA's knowledge regarding the implementation of their duties is still very minimal. There are efforts made to increase knowledge through education and training, but not all training related to their job duties can be followed, the basic reason is the lack of budget allocated to finance the activities in question. The informant also highlighted the lack of regulations governing the development of special GISA competencies. Competency development for ASN is their right, clearly mandated in Perka LAN Number 10 of 2018 concerning Competency Development for ASN Employees, article 4 paragraph (1), states that every civil servant has the right and opportunity to take part in Competency Development by paying attention to the results of performance assessments and competency assessments. the civil servant concerned.

From what has been described above regarding the competency development strategy for GISA which is carried out by means of professional skills training, referring to data and information provided by informants, regulations and the results of similar research, it can be said that this strategy is carried out by involving GISA human resources in training activities related to their job positions. However, there are still many types of training that have not been followed, the main cause is the lack of budget. Even though competency development is the right of every ASN, each ASN follows a minimum of 20 hours of study per year, including GISA. As GISA competency increases, work motivation and GISA performance also increase. A professional and quality GISA results in improved services for the public and local government.

Apart from the training attended by GISA human resources to improve their competency, unit leaders carry out other activities to improve the competency of GISA human resources. These activities take the form of:

1. Socialization of Village Financial Supervision System;

This activity was carried out by the Maluku Province Representative BPKP in collaboration with the Regional Government, in this case the Inspectorate as the technical OPD for GISA HR located at the Inspectorate Office. The aim of

carrying out the activity in question is to increase the technical knowledge of GISA human resources in terms of implementing supervision of village financial management and accountability. The development of technical competencies like this is carried out according to the demands of the task because this is an agency requirement. What we all know is that the Inspectorate has complete main tasks and functions, so competent human resources are needed to carry out these tasks. This is also in line with the mandate of the law, including the Regulation of the State Administration of the Republic of Indonesia Number 10 of 2018 concerning the Development of Civil Servant Competencies, namely that Technical Competency is knowledge, skills and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured and developed specifically. relating to the technical field of the position, which must be carried out by every ASN.

2. Self-Classroom Learning;

The Southwest Maluku Regency Government, through the Inspector as the leader of the Inspectorate, has carried out its own classroom learning activities several times in the form of joint meetings or direct dialogue with GISA human resources. In the activity in question, it was explained how GISA can communicate both in writing and verbally. This is done because the leadership truly realizes that each person has their own strengths and weaknesses. It has been proven that there are still GISAs whose audit results reports, when read either by the leadership or by people with authority, make the flow of the writing difficult to understand. A simple example is that the topic being discussed has not been completed yet, it has entered the discussion of another topic. GISA is required to have more abilities than the community and other ASN, because of its capacity to frequently interact with the wider community who have a variety of knowledge. This makes it fitting that GISA is able to actualize its competence, not just in monitoring control activities, but is able to write the results of supervision and control in the form of reports that are easily understood by auditees, it does not rule out the possibility that these results can also be published in national and international media. Good communication skills for GISA HR are very useful in many aspects of supervision and control. Effective presentation and public speaking skills are important in supervision and control. Developing self-confidence and the ability to give good presentations, and stand up in front of many people and speak well, are also competencies that are very helpful for GISA self-development as well.

3. Socialization of SKP Making Using E-Kin Application;

The aim of preparing the E-Kinerja application by the ASN BKN Performance Directorate is to achieve good government governance in implementing the national performance management system. This application can speed up personnel services such as personnel planning, ASN procurement, promotion, dismissal, data updating, agency transfer, status and position, dashboard and monitoring and reference services. In order to follow up on the aim of making the application in question and to increase knowledge of human resources in Southwest Maluku Regency, which includes GISA, the Personnel and Human

Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) has carried out socialization activities for making SKPs for all ASN in Southwest Maluku Regency. . This activity is carried out in each OPD in turns according to the schedule that has been submitted, involving all ASN in each OPD. This was also done to change the mindset of ASNs who previously thought that SKP was only limited to administration made by each ASN, because actually SKP is a performance management phase of each ASN which includes performance planning, implementation, performance monitoring and coaching, performance assessment and follow up on performance evaluation results. For GISA HR, the aim of the implementation is to make it easier for each ASN to create SKPs, superiors can monitor the input of each subordinate's work results accompanied by supporting evidence/evidence/documentation, when carrying out performance audits they can use the auditee's SKP as a comparison with the budget amount. used to finance an activity. The purpose of conducting a performance audit by GISA HR is to assess whether the resources they have have been utilized efficiently and effectively and have met stakeholder expectations. The implementation of this performance audit is based on the achievements or performance of government agencies. This is mandated in Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 35 of 2018 concerning the 2019 Regional Government Implementation Supervision Policy, which states that the supervision activities carried out by GISA include performance report review activities and also inspection activities including performance inspections.

4. Monitoring and Evaluation Activities;

In the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 35 of 2018 concerning the Supervision Policy for Local Government Implementation in 2019, one of the activities carried out by GISA is monitoring and evaluation activities, which are included in these activities are follow-up to the results of the BPK RI examination, the results of the GISA examination and the assessment of the integrity zone, which these activities have been carried out by GISA Southwest Maluku Regency:

a. Follow-up activities of examination results

In accordance with the mandate of the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 35 of 2018 concerning the 2019 Regional Government Implementation Supervision Policy, the Southwest Maluku Inspectorate annually carries out follow-up activities on audit results, whether audits carried out by the Indonesian Financial Audit Agency (BPK-RI), Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) from both Provinces and from the Government Internal Supervisory Apparatus (GISA) Southwest Maluku Regency. The follow-up activities to the results of this audit are activities and/or decisions carried out by the leadership of the entity being inspected and/or other parties who are competent to implement recommendations from the audit results. Follow-up actions on BPK audit results must be carried out by the leadership of the entity being audited. The head of the audited entity is obliged to provide an answer or explanation to

the BPK regarding the follow-up to the recommendations from the audit results no later than 60 days after the audit report is received. This does not only apply to BPK examination results, but also applies to GISA examination results. GISA, as the implementer of follow-up activities on inspection results, is required to understand the flow of implementation until a finding can be categorized as complete (S). Or in other words, audit findings which the BPK for BPK audit results and GISA for GISA audit results declare to have been followed up are audit findings whose suggestions/recommendations have been followed up in a real and complete manner by the audited entity, so that it is hoped that they can improve financial management and responsibility for the entity concerned. Understanding the flow of implementation of follow-up on examination results for a GISA is something that must be understood and carried out in order to avoid resolving findings that are not under the authority of GISA itself. To arrive at what is stated, the results of the inspection are declared to have been followed up, there is a process that must also be gone through, namely after implementing the follow-up on the results of the inspection, it will continue with updating the data and the implementation is not only at the district level, but at the provincial and BPK levels as well. For Provincial level updates, what is updated are the results of the Provincial GISA examination, just as with the BPK what is updated are the results of the BPK examination, but for BPK findings it is usually referred to as first semester/second semester follow-up. The BPK has the full right to state whether the findings have been implemented in accordance with the recommendations submitted. Likewise, the Provincial GISA has full authority to state whether its findings have been implemented in accordance with the recommendations submitted. Regency GISA does not have the authority to declare that the findings of the BPK and Provincial GISA audit results have been carried out in accordance with recommendations and declared complete.

b. Integrity Zone Assessment

The aim of building an Integrity Zone is to provide effective and efficient services to the community. In its implementation, strengthening supervision has a value of 15%, several indicators that must be implemented are controlling gratification, implementing the Government Internal Monitoring System (SPIP), public complaints, whistleblowing system (WBS), handling conflicts of interest. These things are the duties and responsibilities carried out by GISA. However, in its implementation, not everything has been done, some of it has been done and continues to be done to this day. In carrying out integrity zone assessment activities, as a form of appeal to the wider community, banners/billboards are made and displayed in front of the Inspectorate office, public places and on the sides of highways that are considered busy. Apart from that, pamphlets were made and displayed in the guest room of the Southwest Maluku Regency Inspectorate office. The role

of the Inspectorate in implementing the construction of the Integrity Zone towards a corruption-free area (WBK) and a clean and serving bureaucratic area (WBBM), namely carrying out internal assessments, monitoring and assisting the construction of the Integrity Zone carried out by the OPD, conveying recommendations to the leadership regarding the OPD's performance to obtain WBK/WBBM predicate as well as conducting regular evaluation and monitoring of OPDs that receive WBK/WBBM.

Job Enrichment

The strategy carried out to develop GISA competency in Southwest Maluku is apart from professional skills training by involving GISA human resources in training activities according to their job duties as well as socialization activities and others as explained above, the development of GISA HR competency is also carried out by job desk method and greater responsibility or what is often called job enrichment. Quoting what Mathis and Jackson (2006) said, Job Enrichment is an increase in a job by adding responsibility for planning, organizing, controlling and evaluating work.

From the opinion above, it can be said that additional tasks given outside a person's main duties give rise to greater or greater responsibility. The authority to carry out these tasks starting from planning, implementation and control to evaluation of the tasks in question is his responsibility. The reason why work unit leaders carry out job enrichment is to respond to changes in the current organizational environment where changes always provide challenges for the organization to develop. Apart from that, the leadership is really aware that by giving GISA HR more responsibility they will feel challenged to complete the task in question. This challenge creates work motivation so that GISA's HR competency will increase automatically. With challenges in completing tasks outside the duties of the position held, competence increases. This is in line with the opinion of Simamora (2004) that the job characteristic model is an approach to job enrichment that seeks to design jobs in a way that satisfies needs, recognition and responsibility. Job enrichment adds a source of satisfaction to the job. The Monitoring Center of Prevention or MCP for short is one of the efforts made by the Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK) to encourage the prevention of corruption through preventive efforts by carrying out interventions.

Interventions are carried out in 8 areas, namely APBD planning and budgeting, procurement of goods and services, licensing, GISA supervision, ASN management, regional tax optimization, regional asset management and regional financial governance. Quoting from what was conveyed by Plt. Inspector of Probolinggo Regency, he said that MCP is a reporting system created by the Corruption Eradication Commission to report corruption prevention efforts carried out by the Regional Government every year. This activity is not clearly stated in the regulations governing the implementation of supervision by GISA, however, supervision is one

of the 8 areas that are intervened, so this task is carried out by GISA as the regional supervisory implementer and is given responsibility by the regional leadership for the activity in question.

Apart from MCP activities, GISA HR was also given another additional task, namely evaluating the Draft Village Income and Expenditure Budget (RAPBDes). This activity was carried out in the form of a work team, namely a combination of GISA HR representatives with HR representatives from several OPDs, namely DPMDP2 and KB, Education Service, Industry and Trade and UMKM Service, BKAD, Bappeda and Research and Development. Implementation of this activity is in line with the role of GISA and is the first step in implementing supervision of village financial management and accountability. Early prevention can minimize and even avoid inappropriate village financial management as much as possible. From what has been described above, it can be said that by carrying out Job enrichment for GISA HR in Southwest Maluku Regency, GISA immediately received feedback on the additional tasks given, GISA gained new knowledge, and there was an increase in GISA's individual competency. Even though this job enrichment has only been carried out for these two activities, it has already had an impact on individual GISA competencies.

Comparative study

Comparative studies are one of the activities carried out by organizations to increase employee knowledge and also its application can be carried out within the organization and employee competence can increase. Apart from that, there is innovation in work, employees are also motivated to innovate even more. Employee competence will increase automatically if they are motivated. In order to increase competency and improve the quality of human resources in Southwest Maluku Regency and expand networks, the MBD Government is organizing comparative study activities at several pilot agencies. For GISA human resources, comparative study activities were carried out in Gorontalo Regency.

This comparative study activity by GISA HR was carried out in Gorontalo Regency, regarding procedures for implementing Treasury Claims and Compensation Claims (TP-TGR) for each person, business entity where based on the results of the inspection there were findings of recommendations that had to be completed but there was no good faith in completing them. Apart from GISA HR who took part in this activity, there were also several officials who, because of their positions, held positions on the Advisory Council. From the implementation of these comparative study activities, GISA HR was able to carry out the activities of the Treasury Claims Consideration Council and Compensation Claims for parties who violated in accordance with the recommendations from the audit results of both the BPK, Provincial GISA and Regency GISA. The results of the trial had a positive impact, namely that the amount of payments to the state/regional treasury increased, and the budget was included in other types of legitimate income. It can also be said that,

although the implementation of the trial does not guarantee 100% return to the state/regional treasury for financial findings for each year, it is sufficient to help GISA in carrying out semester follow-up at the Maluku Province BPK-RI and updating provincial level data. This activity is an interconnected part of the Integrity Zone (ZI) assessment activity towards good bureaucracy.

Building Team Work

Human resources in an organization consist of various backgrounds and different individuals, so teamwork is needed to facilitate and speed up the completion of work. The cooperation carried out by each individual in good teamwork can create more appropriate solutions in facing organizational challenges. Carrying out the duties of the GISA position is not only carried out by each individual, but these tasks are also carried out in teams, and more tasks are completed in teams than tasks completed by individuals. Individual GISA assignments are fewer than GISA team assignments. The work carried out by the work team will be completed quickly, the results of the work are the responsibility of all members of the work team. There is also new knowledge that individuals gain. Some of the benefits of someone's involvement in a work team are that each individual works more effectively, many ideas are obtained, team members rely on each other, team members' creativity is increasingly felt, problem solving is more optimal and a source of motivation and inspiration for team members. The development of good team work, apart from complying with the provisions of the GISA job duties, is always pursued by the GISA leadership in order to improve the quality of GISA examination results as well as in order to improve the quality of GISA competence within the Southwest Maluku Government.

5. Conclusions

The discussion regarding the competence of government internal supervisory officials has been carried out by elaborating on the opinions of informants, the 5 dimensions of basic characteristics of Spencer & Spencer (1993) competency approach, and appropriate policies, so it can be concluded that in the motivational dimension, in general, GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency has high motivation in carrying out the duties of the position held, as can be seen from the services provided to the auditee. However, the opportunity to participate in self-development is not in accordance with the duties of the position held. New assignments or work, the completion is based on GISA motivation. The methods used by leaders to foster GISA work motivation are as follows: Carrying out open dialogue, the aim of which is apart from carrying out evaluations, listening to suggestions and input from both GISA individuals and the GISA work team. There is knowledge sharing. Competency development through the implementation of training, an interesting fact from the implementation of this competency development is that not all GISA have had the opportunity to develop themselves, each year the budget allocated to finance

this activity is very minimal or insufficient. In fact, each individual needs to develop their technical competence. There is no local government policy that regulates GISA competency development. The leadership has not fully provided rewards for GISA who are successful in carrying out the assigned tasks. This is not in line with Law Number 20 of 2023 concerning ASN, which mandates that ASN employees have the right to receive awards and recognition. Apart from that, to increase work motivation, there is a need for harmonious relationships between GISA individuals, because the tasks carried out are not only carried out by individuals but are carried out in teams/groups. A good work environment can motivate GISA to work, for this reason it requires control from the leadership as the person in control.

In the characteristic dimension, the average GISA human resources have good characteristics, and are not easily influenced by the environment. Passionate in carrying out tasks, does not compromise with the auditee's personal policies. In the dimension of self-concept, character and motivation are hidden within each person and are difficult to develop through training programs, but will be formed and developed over the length of time a person carries out certain tasks. The longer GISA HR holds the supervisory position, the better it can help them to become. However, to get to know the auditee's personality, GISA requires special training related to psychology. To increase knowledge, technical competency development is needed. GISA HR before carrying out a job, should be equipped with knowledge related to the job in question. This dimension is in line with the motivational dimension related to self-development which is not in accordance with GISA's job title. In general, GISA knowledge is quite good, but specifically GISA knowledge related to job duties is still lacking, development is needed for each individual GISA.

The skills a person has are the main key in completing work tasks. A person is said to be skilled if he continuously improves his abilities, which will be seen from the final results of the tasks carried out. The skills dimension is related to technical competence. Regular development of technical competency for GISA is able to create GISA who are skilled in carrying out their duties. Referring to the opinion expressed by the informant, it can be concluded that in general the competence of GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency is currently good in carrying out the duties of the position held, both in terms of motivation, attitude, self-concept, knowledge and skills and if linked to the concept of competence. technical, managerial and socio-cultural. However, in carrying out the duties of the position there are several obstacles, such as the small quantity of GISA which can be seen from the fact that there are still many vacant GISA positions, the opportunity to participate in competency development in accordance with the job duties is still very limited, the budget to finance GISA competency development activities is minimal.

The competency development strategy that has been carried out for GISA in Southwest Maluku Regency is by holding professional skills training. This is done

by involving GISA human resources in education and training every year, but apart from the obstacles presented above, regulations specifically regulate competency development. GISA doesn't exist yet. Apart from training activities, socialization activities were carried out regarding the village financial monitoring system, carrying out classroom learning activities themselves which were packaged in the form of meetings but the implementation was not routine, socializing the creation of SKPs using the E-Kin application with the aim of helping GISA when conducting performance audits (this activity was only carried out once) , monitoring and evaluation activities related to follow-up to inspection results and assessment of integrity zones. Job Enrichment, GISA is given responsibility outside of the duties of the position to carry out activities (Monitoring Center of Prevention (MCP). This activity is an effort to encourage the prevention of corruption. In addition, GISA is included in the evaluation of the Village APB Draft. Comparative Study, carried out once namely in Gorontalo Regency regarding the implementation of TP-TGR. Building Teamwork, considering that individual GISA tasks are less than the tasks completed by the work team. The strategy for developing GISA competency above is working well but looks very minimal when compared to the duties of the GISA position.

References:

- Adrianto, A. (2019). Strategi Pengembangan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara (Asn) Dalam Meningkatkan Public Service Pada Kantor Dinas Kependudukan Dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Pangkep. *Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar*.
- Ansory, Fadjar, H. Al, Indrasari, & Meithiana. (2018). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia dan Motivasi*. Indomedia Pustaka.
- Armstrong, M. (2007). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: A Handbook Of Human Resource Management*. PT Elex Media Komputindo. Jakarta.
- Bakri, Mahsyar, A., & Malik, I. (2019). Kapabilitas Aparat Pengawas Intern Pemerintah Di Inspektorat Daerah Kabupaten Takalar. *JPPM: Journal of Public Policy and Management*, 1, 2715–2952.
- Boulter, N., Dalziel, M., & Hill, J. (1996). *People and Competencies*,.
- Collins, R. R., & McLaughlin, Y. (2001). *Effective Management*. CCH Australia.
- Dubois, D.D., & Rothwell, W. . (2004). *Competency-Based Human Resources Management*. Palo Alto, Cal : Davies Black Publishing.
- Dunn, M., & Dunkel, N. . (2013). Competency development of southern African housing officers. *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa*, 1(1&2), 67-76.
- Fletcher, S. (2006). *Competence-Based Assessment Technigues: Teknik Penilaian Berbasis Kompetensi*/. Bhuana Ilmu Populer.
- Hariandja, & Efendi, M. T. (2002). “*Manajemen Sumber. Daya Manusia*”,. Grasindo.
- Hasibuan, M. (2008). *Manajemen Dasar, Pengertian, Dan Masalah*. PT Bumi Aksara.

- Idris, E. R., Kadir, A., & Abdi, A. (2020). Pengelolaan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN) Pada Badan Kepegawaian Dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia (BKPSDM) Kabupaten Bantaeng. *Kajian Ilmiah Mahasiswa Administrasi Publik (KIMAP)*, 1(2), 560–573.
- Irawan, S. (2004). *Metode Penelitian Sosial*. PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Jacobs, H. H. (1989). *Interdisciplinary Curriculum Design and Implementation*. Alexandria, VA Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Kerlinger, F. N. (2002). *Asas-Asas Penelitian Behavioral*. Terj.Landung R.Simatupang. Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Manurung, A. G. (2022). Pengembangan Kompetensi Asn Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Pegawai Di Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Asahan Provinsi Sumatera Utara. *Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri*.
- Miles M.B, & Huberman, A. M. (1984). *Analisis Data Kualitatif*. Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.
- Mitrani, J. L. (2001). “Taking the transference”: Some technical implications in three papers by Bion. *The International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 8(82(6), 1085–1104).
- Moleong, L. J. (2014). *Metode penelitian kualitatif edisi revisi*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mondy R, W. (2010). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (10th ed.). PT Gelora Aksara Pratama, Jakarta.
- Mullins, L. J. (2005). *Management and Organizational Behavior*. Prentice Hall.
- Nasution, S. (1996). *Metode penelitian naturalistik*. Tarsito.
- Nuraeni, S., & Vaughan, R. (2019). Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia Kota Bandung. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 1(1), 1–8.
- Octarina, A. (2013). *Pengaruh Etos Kerja Dan Disiplin Kerja Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Pada Dinas Kebudayaan Pariwisata Pemuda Dan Olahraga Kabupaten Sarolangun*. *Manajemen S-I*, 1(1).
- R. L, Mathis & Jackson, J. H., & Jackson, J. H. (2011). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Salemba. Salemba Empat.
- Rares, J. J., & Ogotan, M. (2018). Pengembangan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara Di Dinas Pendidikan Kabupaten Intan Jaya Propinsi Papua. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 4(49).
- Rosidah, A. T. (2018). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia : Pendekatan teoretik dan praktik untuk organisasi publik*. Graha Ilmu.
- Rusdiana, A., & Ibrahim., T. (2020). *Manajemen Pengembangan Human Capital*.
- Sedarmayanti, H. (2016). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Reformasi Birokrasi dan Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil* (Edisi Revi). Refika Aditama.
- Shermon, G. (2004). *Competency Based HRM (A Strategic Resource For Competency Mapping, Assessment And Developing Centres)*. McGrawHill.
- Simamora, H. (2004). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia*. Bagian Penerbitan STIE YPKN.
- Spencer, L.M., & Spencer, S. . (1993). *Competence at work: Models for superior performance*. John Wiley and Sons.

-
- Spencer, L., & Spencer, M., S. (1993). *Competence at Work, Models For Superior Performance*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Sudarmanto. (2009). *Kinerja dan Pengembangan Kompetensi SDM*. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Sumarsono, S. (2009). *Teori dan kebijakan publik ekonomi sumberdaya manusia*. Graha Ilmu.
- Sutrisno, E. (2010). *Manajemen Sumber daya Manusia*. Jakarta Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Syukur, K. (2006). *Metodologi Penelitian Komunikasi*. Citapustaka Media, IAIN.
- Usman, H. (2006). *Manajemen, Teori, Praktik, dan Riset Pendidikan*. Bumi Aksara.
- V, Rivai, M., Mutis, T., & Arafah, W. (2015). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Untuk Perusahaan*. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Weiner, B. (1990). History of Motivational Research in Education. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 82(4), 616–622. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-0663.82.4.616>
- Wibowo. (2007). *Manajemen Kinerja*. PT. Rajagrafindo Persada.
- Wulandari, J. (2018). Identifikasi kompetensi manajerial pada level manajemen menengah dalam industri perbankan Indonesia. *Jurnal Siasat Bisnis*, 22(1), 20–37. <https://doi.org/10.20885/jsb.vol22.iss1.art2>