

## **COMMUNICATION PATTERNS ON IMPLEMENTATION OF E-PLANNING IN ROKAN HILIR REGENCY**

**Muhd Ar. Imam Riauan<sup>1</sup>, Nanang Dwi Cahyono<sup>2</sup> & Aini Maznina A. Manaf<sup>3</sup>**

Department of Communication Science Universitas Islam Riau Pekanbaru, Indonesia<sup>1</sup>;  
Postgraduate Graduate Department of Public Administration Universitas Islam Riau Pekanbaru, Indonesia<sup>2</sup>; Department of Communication Science. International Islamic University Malaysia, Gombak, Malaysia<sup>3</sup>  
imamriauan@comm.uir.ac.id

Received : 15 November 2022, Revised: 14 December 2022, Accepted : 14 December 2022

\*Corresponding Author

### **ABSTRACT**

*A communication pattern is a procedure that may describe a stage of communication that takes place inside a particular communication context. This stage of communication can take place everywhere communication takes place. The process of communication may be understood by looking at communication patterns. The pattern of communication that was utilized in the process of putting e-planning into action in the Rokan Hilir district was the subject of this study. The research technique employed in this investigation was a qualitative research method, which involved summarizing the findings of research conducted in the field. There were a total of eight persons included as participants in this study. Five informants from Regional Apparatus Organizations act as Heads of Program Subdivision in Rokan Hilir Regency, in addition to 1 key informant who is the head of BAPPEDA of Rokan Hilir Regency Head of Program Subdivision. According to the findings of this research, Communication Pattern is utilized throughout the e-planning process with a mentorship program at each phase of the procedure. SIPD is utilized throughout the communication procedure to guarantee that each proposal gets entered into the system. The Regional Head, the Regency DPRD, Regional Apparatus Organizations, Community Apparatus Organizations, and the Community all participate in the coordination process. The community functions as a hub for communication and the generation of ideas, which in turn serve as the foundation for development projects that will be carried out in the Rokan Hilir Regency.*

**Keywords :** *Communication Pattern, Implementation, E-Planning, Rokan Hilir.*

### **1. Introduction**

Transferring one person's meaning to another, from the communicator to the communicant, is what we mean when we talk about communication. Signs and the interpretation of those signs are necessary for communication comprehension. The communication process that takes place inside a state activity may be used to help understand the communication activities within the government. To successfully accomplish state objectives, the government must effectively manage government communication in a way that links community interests with government policy. Communication is the process of transferring messages or symbols that have meaning or significance from one person, called a communicator, to another person, called a communicant, to achieve a particular goal or goal (Riauan & Salsabila, 2022). The efficiency of communication within the government can help it work toward accomplishing its objectives for the state.

In today's technological age, government communication is carried out using many communication technologies. As a result of the rapid advancements that have been made in the field of information technology, it is now obligatory for the government to have the ability to make use of information technology in order to be able to give statistics and information on the growth of regional government. A communication pattern is a procedure that may describe a stage of communication that takes place inside a specific communication context. This stage of communication can take place everywhere communication takes place. The process of communication may be understood by looking at communication patterns. Communication patterns, as explained by Hartini and Kartasaputra in Hidayat, are the standardization of a group of actions, the authors say. According to what was read in Hidayat, communication patterns may be defined as "patterns of conduct that operate as a model. "Communication patterns, as is

customary, consistently adhere to a particular flow or guideline. This guideline also serves to control the manner of communication that takes place inside a social setting. The term "communication patterning" refers to the way in which the form and function of this communication are related to one another (Hadiyat, 2017).

One of the responsibilities of the government is to disseminate information in a way that is open and accessible, responsive, efficient and effective, accountable and participative, quantifiable and fair, and ecologically responsible and sustainable. Article 391 of Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning regional government stipulates that information on regional governments (including data on regional development and finances) must be stored in an information management system. This requirement applies to the provision of information on regional governments. As Law No. 23 of 2014 is in effect, the Minister of Home Affairs has published regulations for the administration of information systems for regional development. Accessing, controlling, and using the information in a timely and accurate manner that is by the priority scale of development demands of an area is made possible by the fast growth of information and communication technology. In accordance with the mandate of Government Regulation Number 8 of 2008 regarding the stages and procedures for preparing, controlling and evaluating the implementation of regional development plans, article 30 paragraph 1 of that regulation states that "In the context of optimal management and utilization of data and information, regions need to build a planning information system regional development." This mandate was made in accordance with the mandate of Government Regulation Number 8 of 2008 regarding the stages and procedures for preparing, controlling and evaluating the implementation of regional development plans.

This study aims to understand communication patterns in implementing e-planning in Rokan Hilir Regency. Rokan Hilir Regency is one of the Regencies in the Outermost, Frontier, and Disadvantaged (3T) regions. Regions with governmental character are the priority targets for the Indonesian Government's development. Downstream Rokan is one of the outermost areas capable of implementing E-Planning. With limited internet network infrastructure and limited human resources, Rokan Hilir is still able to meet the demands of the Government to carry out Work planning in each regional apparatus in Rokan Hilir Regency. The 3T regions have tough challenges in achieving the performance targets set by the Government. Based on these principles, in this study, the researchers attempted to describe the implementation of E-Planning in Rokan Hilir Regency in preparing regional apparatus performance plans.

Previous research has been conducted research examining the problems of E-Planning in Indonesia. Several influencing factors include human resources, infrastructure, regulations, and the E-Planning application used (Ningsih et al., 2020). Research in Ghana shows that E-Planning is implemented in e-waste processing (Asibey et al., 2021). Research in Palembang as the Big City in Sumatera shows that the E-Planning Process in Palembang City is by the timeline or schedule originating from the Palembang City Research and Development Agency (Bappeda Litbang) (Ubaidillah et al., 2021). The results of further research show that the readiness of implementing E-Planning, the most important thing is the readiness of human resources in terms of commitment and technical capabilities in implementing E-Planning (Sani et al., 2017). E-Planning implementation should be integrated with regional financial management to optimize the implementation of E-Government (Gamayuni & Hendrawaty, 2020). The similarity of this research with other studies is in the application of the E-Planning system in making work plans in the government system. The novelty of this research is that this research was carried out in the 3T area, which still faces complex problems in terms of infrastructure and human resources. The difference between this research and previous research is also found in the differences in research objects that focus on communication patterns in implementing e-planning. Thus, research was carried out to understand the application of E-Planning in preparing work plans for regional apparatuses in Rokan Hilir Regency.

This is an inevitable outcome that will occur as a direct result of the creation of an information system within the context of regional growth planning. Until this point, information technology systems have traditionally been seen as an endeavour that extensively uses cutting-edge technology, calls for significant financial investments, and is highly challenging to

implement swiftly and accurately. All of these points constitute a statement that is continually reiterated by the challenges that stand in the way of the growth of this technology. As a result of the passing of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, regional administrations have been granted expanded powers and duties, particularly in regard to the administration of natural resources, human people, and existing potential. For local government organizations to be able to fulfil these rights and responsibilities efficiently and effectively, they need to be able to formulate strategic policies and conduct government operations in a manner that is both efficient and effective, and this must be based on the principles of good governance (Ama, 2021).

There are other communication patterns that develop when e-planning is put into practice. The interests of the community, regional leaders, and legislature members are all considered during the communication process. The process of electronic planning gives communities the opportunity to channel their hopes and dreams. The findings of the observations indicate that the implementation of e-planning is still carried out manually, notwithstanding the transition to using an online planning system. As a direct consequence, the input time on the e-planning tool cannot be met, leading to delays. It is vital to have an understanding of the process of executing government planning through the use of the e-planning system in order to carry out development planning in the correct manner. The process of putting in place an electronic planning system has the potential to provide a thorough description of the planning process.

## **2. Literature Review**

### **Communication**

Effective communication requires the speaker and the listener to share a shared understanding of the information being exchanged. According to the findings of specific studies on inefficient communication patterns, one of the reasons for this is a lack of awareness on the part of the recipient to comprehend the information that is being delivered by the communicator (Pertiwi et al., 2022). The communication process cannot proceed according to the steps that comprise the communication pattern. In order to eliminate the possibility of misunderstandings, there is a specific protocol that must always be adhered to. The irregularity with which the communicant receives directives throughout the communication process leads to information needing to be received correctly, which produces mistakes in the actions carried out.

When communicators participate in the conversion process, communication patterns have a better chance of functioning well (Sadono, 2009). It is necessary to construct rational communication to attain one's communication goals and develop shared meaning. Linear communication only allows message transmission; it does not ensure the occurrence of similarity in meaning since there is no evaluation of the communication process. Linear communication only provides opportunities for message transmission. Both the communicator and the communicant are only aware that the communication process takes place; however, the communicator and the communicant may sometimes share a different interpretation of what was said if there is participation and dialogue activity between the communicator and the communicant.

### **E-Planning**

The E-Planning application allows further development to be carried out following increasingly rapid technological advances (Kalalembang, 2020). Service implies something of a service nature to people who need service, whether provided by an institution, foundation, or by groups and individuals—carrying out the service requires good planning (Mansyur & Nurhidayat, Muhammadiyah, 2013). Development Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation Information System or commonly referred to as E-Planning, is a means of processing electronic data, carrying out the collection of materials and the preparation of guidelines and technical instructions as well as evaluating the implementation of regional government affairs which refers to the laws and regulations that are by its function which in this case is Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 54 of 2010 (Sani et al., 2017). The E-Planning system cannot be separated from E-Budgeting (Pratama & Samopa, 2019).

In general, the objectives of developing a regional development planning information system are 1) Creating integration between program plans and budgets in the regions with online and offline systems; 2) Forming information and communication system interactions that expand regional government relations with local communities related to regional development; 3) Improving the image of regional or government officials who are devoted to the country and are committed to serving the community professionally by prioritizing the principles of effectiveness and efficiency; 4) Make it easier for regional or government apparatus to have a complete database of information related to local government development plans (Harahap et al., 2021).

This application aims to create an efficient and effective coordination and communication system for regional apparatuses and the government regarding regional development planning at various levels, from regional to central. With this technology, ease of access will be better, and accountability can also be carried out properly so that development plans are more focused and integrated, have high synergy, are on time according to the target and are sustainable.

The benefits of this E-Planning system are: 1) Assisting Bappeda and regional work units to formulate work plans based on proposals in the Musrenbang; 2) Assisting Bappeda and regional working units to determine various indicators to measure sustainable, realistic and accurate work results; 3) Assisting Bappeda and regional work units for the preparation of medium-term and annual work plans based on predetermined targets; 4) Providing assistance to Bappeda and regional work units in socializing documents and publications related to regional development plans to the central government (Harahap et al., 2021).

### 3. Research Methods

The purpose of this research is to describe how E-Planning may be utilized in the process of developing work plans for regional equipment in the Rokan Hilir area. Qualitative research is research that is based on the philosophy of postpositivism, used to examine the condition of natural objects where the researcher is the key instrument, sampling of data sources is carried out purposively, collection techniques are triangulation, data analysis is inductive/qualitative, and the results of qualitative research emphasize meaning rather than generalization. In other words, qualitative research is research that is used to examine the condition of natural objects (Sugiyono, 2012). In this investigation, a descriptive qualitative research strategy is utilized, and the resulting data will be descriptive. As opposed to numbers, data in the form of words and pictures is referred to as descriptive data (Moleong, 2019). In order to correctly measure or characterize specific social processes, the link between theory and observation has to be examined. One study that is considered to have the goal of investigating and making a reality or phenomenon clear is called the descriptive approach. In the context of this research, the term "data analysis approach" refers to the interactive model that Miles and Huberman developed. A technique or method for carrying out a task or activity planned in the strategy is included in the method, which means that the method is a component of the strategy (Moleong, 2021).

This study was carried out by the Rokan Hilir Regency's Bureau of Planning and Development (Bappeda). E-Planning is used in developing work schedules for regional equipment in the Rokan Hilir area, which is the focus of the study being conducted here. There were a total of eight persons used as participants in this investigation. 5 informants from Regional Apparatus Organizations who also act as Head of Program Subdivision in Rokan Hilir Regency, in addition to 1 key informant who is the head of BAPPEDA of Rokan Hilir Regency, Head of Program Subdivision.

In order to get information on the minimum service standards that had been carried out in the Rokan Hilir district, this study utilized FGDs, observations, interviews, and documentation as its data collecting procedures. All of these methods were carried out in order to gain data. As a result, the data analysis approach utilized in the qualitative data analysis technique is based on Miles and Huberman's theory and is comprised of three parts. These processes are data reduction, presentation, and conclusion (Kriyantono, 2014).

The process of data reduction involves compiling a summary, selecting the most essential aspects of the data, and concentrating on those aspects. After that, the reduced data will have a more accurate image, and it will be simpler for the researchers to carry out more data gathering

or look for it if required. Researchers will sort out which data are regarded as significant and delete data that is thought to be useless once they have reduced the amount of data they have. In addition, researchers will also examine the veracity of the data by employing a procedure known as "triangulation," which involves data, methodologies, sources, and theoretical frameworks (Moleong, 2019).

#### **4. Results and Discussions**

In the section labelled "Results and Discussion," one can discover all of the scientific results acquired as part of the study data. A scientific explanation that can rationally explain the rationale for getting those clearly explained, complete, detailed, integrated, systematic, and continuous results is anticipated to be provided in this section as part of the expectations that this section will fulfil.

The analysis of the compiled research findings may be provided in the form of a theoretical description, either qualitatively or quantitatively, depending on the researcher's preference. When put into reality, this section may be utilized to compare the findings of the research gained in the present research and the findings of the research reported by past researchers referred to in this study. The outcomes of the research acquired in the study might be discoveries or advances, confirmations of scientific phenomena from earlier researchers, or rejections of a scientific phenomenon from those researchers.

#### **Implementation of Electronic Planning Communication Routines inside the Boundaries of the Rokan Hilir Regency**

According to Hardjana 2016 (Mendrofa & Syafii, 2019), communication patterns are systems that connect members in a group into a single unit that may form patterns of interaction among members in the group. These systems connect members of the group in order to generate patterns of interaction. The purpose of this research is to get an understanding of the communication patterns that take place during the process of e-planning preparation in Rokan Hilir Regency by utilizing the Local Government Information System (SIPD) system.

Communication between the Regional Planning and Development Agency (BAPPEDA), the Community, the DPRD, Regional Heads, and Regional Apparatus Organizations took place throughout the implementation of e-planning in the Rokan Hilir Regency. BAPPEDA coordinates the various planning activities and acts as the administrative body to ensure that the electronic planning process is carried out punctually. Every community proposal and regional government work plan must be entered into the local government information system. This is something that needs to be done (SIPD).

An application known as the Regional Development Information System was developed by the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, employing several media and information technology systems. The Directorate General of Regional Development was responsible for developing this system. This system was developed to assist in synchronizing the growth of the Central Government and the Regional Governments to facilitate their integration. This is done to ensure that there is no duplication of authority between the central government and the provinces, which will allow for the growth of the Republic of Indonesia to proceed in a manner that is both effective and efficient (Agustar et al., 2021). Information processing for regional development planning based on SIPD data includes geographical conditions, demographics, resource potential, economics and finance, as well as information related to key performance indicators for regional government administration. These indicators include aspects of community welfare, public services, and regional competitiveness (Ubaidillah et al., 2021).

The E-Planning process in Rokan Hilir Regency has to have a Regional Government Information System that is an integrated aspect of the regional government information system. This will guarantee that regional development information is available. The Regional Development Information System, which will be referred to from this point forward as the SIPD system, is a system that records, manages, and processes data pertaining to regional development (Sani et al., 2017). The entire process of development planning must be entered into SIPD before it can be considered complete. Regarding Regional Government Information Systems, this is

governed by PERMENDAGRI No. 70 of 2019, which includes Regional Development Information Systems, Regional Financial Systems, and other Regional Government Systems.

The communication pattern in the implementation of the e-planning begins with aggregating interests carried out by the Regional Government, which is formulated in a work plan by the Regional Head led by the Regent. This work plan determines the direction of development for five years in Rokan Hilir Regency.

The planning process in Rokan Hilir Regency is the process of preparing the Regional Government Work Plan (RKPD). The Regional Government, namely the Regent, and the Regional Apparatus Organizations coordinated by BAPPEDA, prepare the Initial Draft Regional Apparatus Work Plan (RKPD). The RKPD is prepared based on regional development priorities adjusted to the vision and mission of the Elected Regent. Regional work plan programs are prepared based on the Regent's vision and mission and adjusted to the nomenclature based on Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 90 of 2019.

The translation of the Regent's vision and mission produces programs that the Regent will carry out during his term of office. The proposals are prepared by each Regional Apparatus Organization that is directly related to the Regent's development priorities. Each regional apparatus conducts an analysis of the potential of the regions which are the targets of the Regent's program of activities by identifying the main problems faced by the community per the Regent's development policies.

The initial development plan also involves other stakeholders who have the authority to propose work programs based on the main ideas that are aggregated based on the community's interests. In addition to the Regional Apparatus Organizations, the parties involved in preparing the initial draft of the performance of the regional apparatus were members of the Rokan Hilir Regency Regional People's Legislative Council, Community Organizations and Villages. The three stakeholders are channels for the community to convey their aspirations so that the interests of the people in their respective regions can be conveyed and proposed in the development program in Rokan Hilir Regency.

Members of the DPRD of Rokan Hilir Regency proposed their main ideas based on the recess results in their chosen areas by gathering the aspirations of their respective constituents. The Community Organization proposes the interests of the community according to the field of an organization being carried out, while the Village apparatus and the community in the Village propose all needs that are directly related to the interests of the Village.

All of these proposals must refer to the Medium-Term Development Plan, a translation of the Regent's vision and mission and development priority programs during the Regent's term of office. The initial draft was consulted in a public consultation forum, and after being mutually agreed upon, it was inputted into the SIPD System.

The work plan is inputted by stakeholders who collect proposals based on the main ideas of the community. Stakeholders who propose descriptions of activities are DPRD members, villages, and sub-district organizations. Proposal. This was then verified by the Regional Apparatus Organization (OPD), which was adjusted to the proposed dictionary according to the initial draft program of the RKPD. The results of the verification will then be validated by the Regional Planning, Development, Research and Development Agency (BAPPEDA). The verification and validation process is carried out to adjust the activity descriptions according to the district head's development priorities specified in the RPJMD.

The following process is to approve the final draft of the Regional Government Work Plan. This process involves coordinating forums between OPD and SKPD Musrempang. After finding a joint agreement, the Final RKPD Plan is approved at the district level and will then be validated at the Provincial BAPPEDA level. The Provincial BAPPEDA validates the mechanism for preparing the RKPD, which is then given a recommendation by the Governor to be stipulated as an RKPD and then determined by the Regent as the RKPD, which forms the basis for development activities in the Region funded by the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD). SIPD enables the implementation of E-planning to run effectively. All suggestions from stakeholders can be recorded comprehensively. This allows for no overlapping of activities in each regional working apparatus. Regional planning can be carried out properly because each proposal can be ascertained to be processed without being left behind.

That the pattern of communication is a system that connects members in a group into a single unit that can form patterns of interaction among members in the group. This study aims to understand the communication patterns that occur in the e-planning preparation process using the Local Government Information System (SIPD) system in Rokan Hilir Regency (Mendrofa & Syafii, 2019). Communication patterns can work well with the participation of communicators in the dialogue process (Sadono, 2009). Dialogical communication must be built to achieve communication goals to create an ordinary meaning. Communication that runs linearly only provides opportunities for message transmission but does not guarantee the occurrence of similarity in meaning because there is no evaluation of the communication process. The communicator and communicant understand that the communication process occurs, while the similarity of meaning may only sometimes occur if there is participation and dialogue between the communicator and communicant.

Communication is understood as reality, but many people often misunderstand it as cyberspace, even though in fact the existence of this electronic system itself is actual, in which virtual communication is carried out by representing digital information that is not directly connected to each other (Umilasari, 2020). According to Townsend in Tubbs and Moss, the concept of communication patterns is based on understanding and explains the communication network, also known as patterns of human interaction. There are five communication networks or patterns: chain patterns, wheel patterns, Y patterns, circle patterns, and all channel patterns (Briliana & Destiwati, 2018).

Meanwhile, Soejanto (Azeharie & Khotimah, 2015) explains that communication patterns are a simple description of the communication process that shows the connection between one communication element and other elements. Communication patterns are needed in the communication process to determine the proper description or structure of the communication activities carried out.

Using SIPD in the regional development planning system increases the effectiveness of implementing development planning. It is inseparable from the 3 T regions (underdeveloped, foremost, and outermost), and its application provides certainty for the absorption of all proposals in regional development. The application of SIPD is related to efforts to ensure the implementation of regional governance to improve public services and realize the welfare of the people of Rokan Hilir.

The application of e-planning in the SIPD system provides certainty for integrating central and regional government activity programs. An information system that uses a computer system. Computer-based groups and decision support systems have been developed to facilitate idea exchange and evaluation (Fosso Wamba & Akter, 2019). This information system provides convenience for the planning database system. Archiving or storage activities become more manageable, and the data related to planning can be accessed whenever needed. Implementation of e-planning with the SIPD application also provides guarantees for data security that can be restored in the event of a software attack or hardware damage. All technologies (instruments) contribute to the quality of planning and enhance the quality of its performance.

Citizen participation should be an essential part of an urban planning process if the needs of the local population are to be addressed (Goodspeed, 2019). E-planning using the SIPD application also ensures that the involvement of the community is increasing. Communities can propose their aspirations through DPRD members when carrying out activities outside the DPRD building (Reses). Community aspirations are conveyed to DPRD members when they go down to their chosen areas. The community through the Village Musrembang can also ensure that their aspirations can be conveyed adequately through village proposals which are also facilitated by sub-district officials.

Especially in the 3T areas, the implementation of e-planning is a big challenge. Problems with human resources and media and communication technology infrastructure are problems that hinder planning with the SIPD application. The village community must input it at the sub-district level, which of course can result in the community's proposals being left behind. Adaptation in the use of new forms and new systems is a problem that must be overcome so that the e-planning implementation process can be carried out. Previous research has shown that the problem of plan adaptation differs from most problems studied in computational complexity, in that the data we

are given includes a 'hint' that can very well be neglected if necessary. Such format problems include other problems, such as case-based reasoning in general. The complexity of other forms of case-based reasoning is an interesting problem (Tian et al., 2022).

The problem of distance and internet network reliability is a problem in implementing electronic information systems (Manengal et al., 2022). This was resolved with assistance from the BAPPEDA team. Human resource assistance is carried out to solve e-planning problems (Erialdy et al., 2021). The district government and the government assist at the sub-district and village levels. Communication is built to ensure that all proposals can be inputted adequately by each stakeholder. At the sub-district level, one operator is assigned to ensure that all proposals are correctly inputted. Assistance from BAPPEDA as the coordinator in the implementation of development planning is also continuing so that the community and all stakeholders can utilize and implement SIPD effectively.

## 5. Conclusion

E-planning is particularly difficult to adopt in the 3T regions, which presents a significant obstacle in the process of its implementation. The planning process for the SIPD application needs to be improved by issues relating to human resources and infrastructure for media and communication technologies. The community of the Village must provide input at the sub-district level, which, as a result, runs the risk of the community's recommendations being overlooked. For the process of e-planning implementation to be carried out, one of the challenges that must be solved is an adaptation, both in terms of the usage of new forms and new technologies.

The process of developing the preliminary version of the Regional Government's work plan is a component of the Communication Pattern that takes place. In addition, SIPD is utilized throughout the communication process to guarantee that each and every proposal is entered into the appropriate location inside the system. Coordination occurs between the Regional Heads, the Regency DPRD, the Regional Apparatus Organizations, the Community Organizations, and the Village Apparatuses. The community functions as the primary means of communication to generate concepts that will serve as the foundation for the development program carried out in the Rokan Hilir Regency.

## Acknowledgement

A big thank you to the government of the Republic of Indonesia for funding this research. This research is a DIKTI grant from the Student Thesis Research scheme of the Directorate General of Higher Education, Research and Technology, Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology.

## References

- Agustar, A., Syarfi, I. W., & Wati, E. (2021). Sinkronisasi Antara Perencanaan Nagari Dengan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah di Kabupaten Solok. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Bhakti Praja*, 11(1), 18–46.
- Ama, D. A. (2021). *Implementasi Kebijakan Walikota Medan Nomor 12 Tahun 2020 dalam Penatalaksanaan Perpindahan PNS Antar Unit Kerja di Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kota Medan*.
- Asibey, M. O., King, R. S., Lykke, A. M., & Inkoom, D. K. B. (2021). Urban planning trends on e-waste management in Ghanaian cities. *Cities*, 108. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2020.102943>
- Azeharie, S., & Khotimah, N. (2015). Pola Komunikasi Antarpribadi antara Guru dan Siswa di Panti Sosial Taman Penitipan Anak “Melati” Bengkulu. *Jurnal Pekommas*, 18(3), 213–224.
- Briliana, C. N. N., & Destiwati, R. (2018). Pola Komunikasi Virtual Grup Percakapan Komunitas Hamur “HAMURinspiring” Di Media Sosial Line. *Jurnal Manajemen Komunikasi*, 3(1), 34–50.
- Erialdy, E., Mulyanto, A. I., Prastowo, S. L., & Permana, A. I. (2021). Pendampingan Masyarakat Sebagai Fasilitator Menuju E-Planning Hasil Musrenbang Kelurahan. *IKRA-ITH ABDIMAS*, 4(1), 131–137.

- Fosso Wamba, S., & Akter, S. (2019). Understanding supply chain analytics capabilities and agility for data-rich environments. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, 39, 887–912. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOPM-01-2019-0025>
- Gamayuni, R. R., & Hendrawaty, E. (2020). E-Planning, E-Budgeting and the Quality of Government Institution Performance Accountability System in Indonesia. *Talent Development & Excellence*, 12(1s), 218–225.
- Goodspeed, R. (2019). Participatory e-Planning with civic crowdfunding: Donor background, involvement, and social capital outcomes. *International Journal of E-Planning Research*, 8(2), 68–87. <https://doi.org/10.4018/IJEPR.2019040104>
- Hadiyat, Y. (2017). Pola Komunikasi Prostitusi Daring di Twitter. *Jurnal PIKOM (Penelitian Komunikasi Dan Pembangunan)*, 18(2), 125–136.
- Harahap, D. R., Badaruddin, B., & Harahap, R. H. (2021). The Effectiveness of the Implementation of the E-Planning System in Development Planning in the South Tapanuli Regency Government. *Perspektif*, 10(1), 76–87. <https://doi.org/10.31289/perspektif.v10i1.4073>
- Kalalembang, E. (2020). Application of E-Learning in the Perspective of Technology Determination. *Jurnal Ilmiah Maju*, 3(1), 31–42.
- Kriyantono, R. (2014). *Communication Research Practical Techniques*. Kencana Prenada Media Grup.
- Manengal, J. F., Gosal, R., & Pangemanan, S. E. (2022). Efektivitas Penggunaan Aplikasi E-Planning Dalam Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Kabupaten Minahasa Tenggara (Studi Di Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Kabupaten Minahasa Tenggara). *GOVERNANCE*, 2(2).
- Mansyur, S., & Nurhidayat, Muhammadiyah, J. U. (2013). Bureaucratic Pathology in Service Quality. *Kolaborasi : Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 5(1), 965–972.
- Mendrofa, A. J., & Syafii, M. (2019). Pola Komunikasi Organisasi dalam Meningkatkan Eksistensi Komunitas Marga Parna di Kota Batam (Studi Kasus Komunitas Marga Parna di Batu Aji Kota Batam). *Scientia Journal: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa*, 1(1).
- Moleong, L. J. (2019). *Qualitative Research Methodology (Revised Edition)*. Remaja Rosda Karya. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2013.02.055>
- Moleong, L. J. (2021). *Qualitative Research Methodology (Revised Edition)*. Remaja Rosda Karya.
- Ningsih, V., Sari, R. N., & Rasuli, M. (2020). Analysis of the Implementation of E-Planning and E-Budgeting in Local Government (Case Study in Bengkalis District Government). *Applied Technology Research: 2020*, 1–9.
- Pertiwi, P., Daulay, M., & Siregar, Y. D. (2022). Pola Komunikasi Pemerintah Desa dalam Menciptakan Kesadaran Masyarakat Akan Protokol Kesehatan pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19 di Desa Sei Kasih Kecamatan Bilah Hilir Kabupaten Labuhanbatu. *MUKADIMAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sejarah, Dan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 6(2), 270–276.
- Pratama, R. Y., & Samopa, F. (2019). Design of Enterprise Application Integration (EAI) in E-Planning and E-Budgeting Systems. *IPTEK Journal of Proceedings Series*, 5.
- Riauuan, M. A. I., & Salsabila, Z. F. (2022). Virtual Communication Pattern Of Twitter Autobase Management (Study Of Sharing Real Life Things Media On @ bertanyarl Account). *Jurnal Komunikasi*, 14(1), 192–203. <https://doi.org/10.24912/jk.v14i1.16118>
- Sadono, D. (2009). Perkembangan pola komunikasi dalam penyuluhan pertanian di Indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi Pembangunan*, 7(2).
- Sani, B. F., Harianto, & Falatehan, A. F. (2017). Bogor City Government Readiness Strategy in Implementing E-Planning Based Development Planning. *Jurnal Manajemen Pembangunan Daerah*, 9(1), 57–67.
- Sugiyono. (2012). *Quantitative, Qualitative and R & D Research Methods*. Alfabeta. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Tian, L., Liu, J., Liang, Y., & Wu, Y. (2022). A participatory e-planning model in the urban renewal of China: Implications of technologies in facilitating planning participation. *Environment and Planning B: Urban Analytics and City Science*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/23998083221111163>

- Ubaidillah, Ermadiani, & Abdulrohman. (2021). Implementation of e-Planning in Palembang City. *Jembatan: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 18(1), 109–122.
- Umilasari, P. (2020). *Strategi Komunikasi Virtual Akun Twitter@ K\_DramaIndo Dalam Menyebarkan Budaya Pop Korea di Indonesia*. Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau.